GENDER STEREOTYPE ROLE IN THE BUSINESS SUCCESS OF WOMEN ENTREPRENEURS IN INDONESIA

Hendry Hartono1, Wella Luhur2, Sasmoko3, Nugroho Juli Setiadi4, Abdul Aziz Abdulah5
1,2,3,4Bina Nusantara University, Indonesia
5University Sultan Zainal Abidin, Malaysia

Abstract

Having good business relationships with stakeholders and have innovative behaviours that are competitive, full of challenges, as well as risks to achieve success in the business. In relationships and behaviours, human beings are inseparable from their views on the attributes or characteristics of women and that have to be performed by women and men who are subconsciously embedded and absorbed in each individual's subconscious, which is commonly referred to as gender stereotypes. This is not apart from its influences on business relationships and innovative behaviours of women entrepreneurs in their business to achieve business success. It is interesting to examine whether gender stereotypes are moderate business relationships and innovative behaviours towards the success of women entrepreneur business in Indonesia. Sources of data obtained by distributing questionnaires and interviewing 109 women entrepreneurs. This research is a quantitative research using the Hierarchical Regression Analysis research method. The findings of this study show that women are more likely to have a relationship with women entrepreneurs. Gender stereotype as a moderating variable does not affect business relationships with a moderate relationship between innovative behaviour towards business success in women entrepreneurs in Indonesia, and the result shows gender stereotype decrease the influence of innovative behaviours of women entrepreneurs to the success of their business.

Keywords: Gender Stereotype, Business Relationship, Innovative Behaviour, Business Success, Women Entrepreneur

INTRODUCTION

Entrepreneur has broader economic impact from the perspective of developing new jobs, new business sectors and also wealth creation. Women’s participation has been realize to be significant in the economics that can enhance national economic growth, job creation and poverty alleviation. These participation can lead to less inequality in the two largest population’s subgroups: men and women.

Based on a survey conducted by the World Bank in 2009 on companies operating in Indonesia, it showed that 42.8 percent of formal Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) were owned by women. At the same time, 46.7 percent is women employment, from which it can be concluded that women’s SMEs have a significant contribution to economic growth and job creation in Indonesia, which is about the same size as that contributed by SMEs that owned by men.

Business that owned by women are different from men, also how managing the business are also different. The types of business that managed by women
concentrated in specific business sectors and tend to have less performance than business that managed by men. The important issue are preferences and constraints that placed on women ability and culture as an unfairly target.

The obstacles faced by women entrepreneurs in running a business are generally personal characteristics caused by workload due to the dual role of a woman, which in addition to managing the business they have, women entrepreneurs also have to take care of their families and households. In addition, women entrepreneurs also face structural characteristic barriers, such as limited access to capital and access to marketing where female entrepreneurs have lower access to marketing information compared to male entrepreneurs. One factors that has been identified that barriers to the development of women entrepreneurs is the result of gender stereotypes between women and men in a patriarchal environment (Widowati, 2012; Ardhanari, 2007). With the existence of barriers to the business undertaken by women entrepreneurs can influence business success from businesses owned by women entrepreneurs.

In running a business, an entrepreneur is expected to have innovative behaviour in order to be able to obtain a business success (Azizah & Marifah, 2017). Person's ability to create resources, this is important because nothing can become a resource until humans are able to find benefits from something that is found in nature to give economic value to it. In addition to having innovative behaviour, entrepreneurs must also be able to establish good relationships with stakeholders in carrying out their business. Because a well-established business relationship can bring success to entrepreneurs. Business without a good performance becomes impossible to be successful, so as entrepreneurs should be able to establish a good business relationship with stakeholders.

Entrepreneurs who are able to establish good relationships with customers and employees in the long term, will help entrepreneurs through both difficult and challenging times. In establishing relationships and behaviour that directs humans to interact and act irrespective of the views of the perpetrators. In establishing relationships and behaviour, humans cannot be separated from their views on the attributes or characteristics that should be owned by women and men or the roles that should be carried out by women and men who unconsciously are embedded and absorbed in the subconscious of each individual on this earth, which is commonly referred to as a gender stereotype.

The effects given both positive and negative, cannot be separated from its influence on business relationships and innovative behaviour of women entrepreneurs in running their businesses to achieve business success. So it is interesting to examine how the influence of gender moderation is stereotyped on the ability to build and foster good business relationships and innovative behaviour that can bring business success to women entrepreneurs in Indonesia.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Having a relationship with various types of business people will provide access to the resources needed so that it can help small companies to overcome various kinds of obstacles faced, as well as resources that can be accessed by small companies through relationships between organizations that have significant potential in increasing innovation and sales (del Mar Fuentes-Fuentes, Bojica, Ruiz-Arroyo, & Welter, 2015). Business relationships are like other relationships where they need a lot of effort to maintain and they must be mutually beneficial for all stakeholders. Characteristics of business relationships can be explained such as trust, commitment, cooperation, communication, and relationship-specific investment. (Zaefarian, Thiesbrummel, Henneberg & Naudé, 2017).

According to Moorman et al. in Zaefarian et al. (2017) trust is a desire to depend on an exchange partner where someone has confidence in them. From the definition of trust it can be concluded that the importance
of trust and confidence in the exchange partner, which refers to the credibility of the exchange partner. Have confidence that trading partners are experts and can be relied upon in making transactions effectively "(Zaefarian et al., 2017; Sigauw, Simpson, & Baker, 1998) and refer to the intentions and motives of partners in considering benefits acceptable to his colleague (Zaefarian et al., 2017; Ganesan, 1994). Fang et al. in Zaefarian et al. (2017) explains that the influence of trust can be explored at different organizational levels, studying the effect of trust at the inter and intra-organizational levels. According to Zaheer et al. in Zaefarian et al., (2017) revealed that there are two levels of trust, namely interorganizational trust and interpersonal trust. At both of these levels, trust enhances specific relationships for investment and communication, so that it can improve agility and performance. Then it can be concluded that trust can increase information sharing while its absence can increase conflict and even result in ending the relationship. (Zaefarian et al., 2017).

Commitment

Commitment or commitment has an important role in the sustainability of a business relationship. This is because of the level of interdependence between sellers and buyers who can guarantee the success of long-term business relationships and also to maintain them. This good business relationship refers to the implicit or explicit promise of a relationship that takes place. Whereas the lack of commitment can encourage the use of power and long-term contracts.

Several aspects of commitment have been examined in the study of organizational relations. Affective commitment is the most frequently cited aspect of commitment in the literature in question. Zaefarian et al. (2017) describes Affective commitment as the desire to continue relationships because of the positive influence on partners. On the other side of behaviour commitment refers to clear manifestations of the continuation of relationships and related investments (Zaefarian et al., 2017; Sharma, Young, & Wilkinson, 2006). According to Anderson and Weitz in Zaefarian et al., (2017) commitment must refer to the willingness of both parties to make temporary sacrifices in view of stable and profitable long-term relationships.

Morgan and Hunt in Zaefarian et al. (2017) revealed that cooperation or cooperation arises from the existence of trust and commitment that drives the success of a relationship. From this perspective the actors involved in a relationship will work together when they are committed to one another, which together commit to make the relationship work. Collaboration is an effort made by parties who work together to achieve a common goal. This concept implies that the actors involved in a relationship combine their efforts to build successful relationships.

According to Anderson and Narus in Zaefarian et al. (2017) Communication is the sharing of information in which the sharing of information can be in the form of formal and informal information that is meaningful and timely between companies. Previous communication was an antecedent of trust, while trust was an accumulation that facilitated communication (Zaefarian et al., 2017). The theory of trust commitment also supports this statement by Morgan and Hunt in Zaefarian et al., (2017). In communication, it is expected that there is a bilateral relationship between the two actors involved in a relationship to proactively provide valuable information to partners that can influence partner operations (Zaefarian et al., 2017; Heide and Miner, 1992). According to Morgan and Hunt in Zaefarian et al. (2017) such activity is expected to help align expectations and also to avoid conflict and resolve disputes between the two parties.

Relationship-Specific Investment (RSI)

According to Ganesan (1994), Relationship-specific investment (RSI) refers to investment in special relationships, which cannot be easily restored or transferred to other relationships. This is often related to the adaptation that must be made to partners when conducting business relationships so that it is not easy for
both parties to recover and transfer relations to other parties easily and quickly (Zaefarian et al., 2017).

Therefore, it can be described as an adaptation that allows entrepreneurs to secure business with their business partners. According to Palmatier et al., (2007) RSI is formed only in the long run, so they can have a different impact on buyers and sellers. With RSI, sellers send strategic signals to buyers that they are committed and care about business relationships that are fostered.

**Innovative Behavior**

Innovative behaviour is a process that has many stages that must be passed, which is a process of an individual recognizing a problem faced so that it is able to produce a thought idea and solution, whether a solution that is new or existing and adopted, works to advance and build support for thought ideas produced, and be able to produce prototypes or models that can be used and useful for the organization or parts therein (Thurlings, Evers, & Vermeulen, 2015; Carmeli, Meitar & Weisberg, 2006).

According to Agustina (2014) Innovative behaviour an individual's eagle attitude that aimed to produce, introduce and apply new things, which is beneficial in various levels of the organization. The following are 5 (five) components that shape the realization of Innovative behaviour, namely: opportunity exploration, generativity, formative investigation, championing, and application (Agustina, 2014; Kresnandito & Fajrianthi, 2012; Kleysen & Street, 2001; West & Farr, 1989).

**Opportunity Exploration**

Opportunity Exploration is the ability to find opportunities for innovation through extensive learning and exploration. In the opportunity exploration there are four behaviours that shape it, namely paying attention to the source of opportunity, finding opportunities to innovate, recognizing opportunities, and gathering information about opportunities.

**Generativity**

Generativity is the leader in the emergence of concepts aimed at development which are more focused on producing beneficial changes to services, products, members and organizations. In generativity there are three behaviors that form it, namely to produce ideas and solutions for opportunities, produce representations and opportunity categories, and produce associations and combinations of ideas and information.

**Formative Investigation**

Formative Investigation pay attention to improving ideas, solutions, opinions and try to investigate them. In formative investigation there are three behaviours that form it, namely formulating ideas and solutions, experimenting with ideas and solutions, and evaluating ideas and solutions.

**Championing**

Championing involves behaviour in the innovation process, which is important for realizing the potential of ideas, solutions, and opinions as well as business practices to realize creative ideas. In championing there are four behaviors that shape, namely mobilizes resources, persuade and influence, motivate and negotiate, and challenge and take risks.

**Application**

Application develop, test and commercialize innovative ideas and make innovations as part of mandatory activities in business. In the application there are three behaviours that support it, namely applying, modifying and implementing.

**Business Success**

To obtain business success, many efforts must be made in all fields that influence the occurrence of business success. Generally, SMEs operate around traditional lines, and many factors influence and cause the success of SMEs regardless of the location of SMEs and market conditions. (Jasra, Khan, Hunjra,
Rehman, & Azam, 2011). Being able to know how to survive in a competitive market is the most important thing an entrepreneur or business must have, so that business people can get success in their business. In addition, marketing strategies (marketing strategy), financial resources (financial resources), technology resources (technological resources), information access (information access), government support (government support), and business plans (business plans) are factors that must be owned in running a business to realize business success. (Pletnev & Barkhatov, 2016; Jasra et al., 2011).

**Gender Stereotype**

Gender stereotypes are a general view or prejudice about attributes, or characteristics that women and men should have or the roles that should be performed by women and men. Gender stereotypes can be seen as positive and also negative. Using gender stereotypes in clarifying a particular person or group is a universal process, because it allows us to quickly sort them into two groups, namely women and men using prominent visual and physical characteristics (Perez-Quintana, Hormiga, Martori & Madariaga, 2017; Gupta & Bhawe, 2007).

Basically, gender stereotype is a belief in which that belief can cause the holder to make assumptions about group members subjectively, women and / or men, and also the practice of applying stereotypical beliefs to others. Gender stereotype will be dangerous when limiting the ability of women or men to develop their personal abilities, pursue their professional careers and make choices about their lives and life plans.

In the literature on entrepreneurship, the theory of the role of congruence proposes that women and men are expected to behave in ways that are in accordance with their gender roles. The role of entrepreneurs has been shown to be stereotypically described as masculine (Malmström, Johansson & Wincent, 2017). This is because there is a view that perceives a mismatch between women's gender roles and the role of entrepreneurs which implies that women are considered less profitable than men as potential entrepreneurs. Thus, congruity's role theory rationalizes why men can have a significant advantage over women, due to natural compatibility between men and masculine behavior due to male harmony, masculinity, and entrepreneurship.

Congruity role theory have confidence that gender is related to communal attributes and agenic. Characteristics of communal is a characteristic of women, which describes concern for the welfare of others; for example, loving, helpful, kind, sympathetic, interpersonal sensitive, nurturing, and gentle. On the contrary, agentic characteristics are more identical characteristics for men, especially describing a firm, controlling and confident tendency; for example, aggressive, ambitious, dominant, strong, independent, independent, confident, and tends to act as a leader. (Malmström et al., 2017; Bakan, 1966; Eagly, 1987).

From the results of research conducted by Perez-Quintana, et al. (2017) found 8 attributes for femininity, eleven attributes for masculine, six attributes for androgyny and six attributes for undifferentiated ones from 31 attributes by the Bem Sex-Role Inventory (Perez-Quintana, et al., 2017; Bem, 1981).

**Table 1. Bem Sex-Role Inventory**
Masculine items | Feminine items | Androgynous items | Undifferentiated Items
--- | --- | --- | ---
**Self-confident** | Kind, attentive | Innovative | Assertive
**Prone to taking risk** | Gullible | Creative | No systematic
**Prone to position** | Flexible | Analytical | Self-sufficient

**Individualistic** | Loyal | Unpredictable | Obedient

**Determined, steady, temperamental** | Sensitive to the needs of the others | Active, energetic, capable of sustained effort Leadership | Vehement in opinions

**Leadership capacity** | Submissive | Optimistic | Yielding

**Independent** | Humble

**Make decisions** | Shy, discreet

**Ambitious**

**Dominant, aggressive**

**Competitive**

**RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

The research method used in this study is the questionnaires method, where research is conducted on large and small populations, but the data studied is data from samples taken from the population (Sugiyono, 2013). The approach in this study is a quantitative approach which is used to measure statistically how much influence business relationships and innovative behavior influence with gender stereotypes as a moderating variable towards the business success of women entrepreneurs in DKI Jakarta. Time Horizon that is used is one shot, this is because research is carried out only in a certain period of time or once, and namely as long as the respondent is a female entrepreneur who owns SMEs in DKI Jakarta. And the analysis unit used is an individual and here the status of the respondent is a female entrepreneur. The sampling technique in this study uses proportional simple random sampling where the technique of taking member samples from the population is done randomly regardless of the strata that exist in the population (Sugiono, 2013). In this study a sample was divided into five parts from the DKI Jakarta province / region, such as West Jakarta, North Jakarta, Central Jakarta, South Jakarta and East Jakarta. The sample target in this research is female entrepreneurs who have SMEs in DKI Jakarta whose population is not known with certainty, so that in this study the calculation of convenience sampling technique was used.

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS**

Respondents in this study as a whole are female entrepreneurs who running SMEs, especially in DKI Jakarta which are spread in 5(five) region: West Jakarta, North Jakarta, Central Jakarta, South Jakarta and East Jakarta. With the number of respondents as many as 109 female entrepreneurs. From the questionnaire data contained in the attachment can be seen the description of the respondent’s responses to each item statement.

![Figure 1. Histogram Business Relationship](image-url)
From the results of 109 respondents’ responses to the business relationship, it can be seen that affective commitment has the greatest value of 4.42 points. And interpersonal trust has the smallest value is 3.73 points. So, it can be explained that in establishing business relationships women entrepreneurs rely on affective commitment in establishing business relationships where affective commitment is a desire to continue relationships with partners because of good relationships. Furthermore, in establishing business relations women entrepreneurs in DKI Jakarta tend to be careful in giving their trust in business interactions with their business partners.

From the results of 109 respondents’ responses to innovative behavior, it can be seen that exploration opportunities have the greatest value, which is worth 4.30 points. And application has the smallest value is 4.06 points. So, it can be explained that women entrepreneurs in Indonesia tend to have innovative behavior that is able to pay attention to, search for, recognize and gather information about the opportunities that exist, which are able to bring women entrepreneurs towards innovation in business. However, women entrepreneurs tend to have difficulties in implementing, modifying and routinizing them in developing, testing and commercializing innovative ideas and making innovations as part of mandatory activities in conducting business. So that it can be concluded that women entrepreneurs in DKI Jakarta still have to develop their ability to apply innovative ideas into real things, not only be able to pay attention, find, recognize and gather information about opportunities so that business women entrepreneurs in Indonesia can achieve success.

From the results of the responses of 109 respondents it can be seen that technology has the greatest value, which is worth 4.17 points. And government support has the smallest value is 3.44 points. So, it can be explained that technology plays a very important role in achieving the business success of women entrepreneurs in DKI Jakarta. Because technology helps women entrepreneurs in DKI Jakarta in obtaining more customers and technology also increases the business productivity level of women entrepreneurs in DKI Jakarta.

Furthermore, it can be seen that women entrepreneurs in DKI Jakarta consider that the Indonesian government is still not contributing in supporting the business success of women entrepreneurs who have SMEs in DKI Jakarta. Not that, the Indonesian government does not pay attention to entrepreneurs, especially women entrepreneurs who have SMEs in DKI Jakarta. It could be that the programs created by the Indonesian government are still not socialized right on target. It is hoped that the government will pay more attention and support to women entrepreneurs who have SMEs so that SMEs owned by women in Indonesia can develop and gain business success. Because this is one of the keys to
improving Indonesia’s economy and to reduce unemployment in Indonesia.

From the results of the responses of 109 respondents, it can be seen that flexible has the greatest value, which is worth 4.28 points. And submissive has the smallest value is 2.38 points. So, it can be explained that the women entrepreneurs in running their businesses are very flexible. Where this flexibility has a positive and negative influence in running a business, if it is too flexible a woman entrepreneur in running a business can be stated that women entrepreneurs tend to have a difficult position themselves, tend to have a feeling of not feeling good, and have the impression of being less strict in doing business. The positive side of flexibility in running a business will build friendlier relationships with stakeholders. But it’s best to do business in business relationships not to be equated with ordinary friendships, this is one of the weaknesses of female entrepreneurs in running a business.

Furthermore, in conducting business, women entrepreneurs can be said to disagree with gender stereotypes which state that women entrepreneurs tend to follow the wishes and sayings of others in conducting business. So it can be concluded that women entrepreneurs generally have a flexible attitude in business, but that does not mean they want to listen to the wishes and sayings of other parties in business, women entrepreneurs have firmness in running their business but remain flexible so that business relationships remain bind up with good. It can be said that this is a good blend of business.

**Influence Business Relationship of Business Success**

Analysis of the effect of business relationships on business success and influence in this study was carried out by using hierarchical regression analysis. Tests are conducted to measure the effect of a business relationship on a business success that can be seen in Figure 5 below:

The results shown in Figure 5, explained that if women entrepreneurs are able to establish and have good business relationships with business stakeholders (stakeholders) it will have a good influence on the business success of women entrepreneurs. The results of this study are in line with the results of research conducted by del Mar Fuentes-Fuentes et al. (2015) which shows that having relationships with various types of business people will provide access to the resources needed so that small companies can overcome various kinds of obstacles faced. In addition, it is also will allow small companies to obtain the necessary resources through relationships between organizations that have significant potential in improving innovation and sales, which are important things in achieving business success. Furthermore, from the research conducted by Xesha, Iwu, and Slabbert (2014) it also shows that having, developing and maintaining good relationships with stakeholders is an important factor in achieving business success. So, this conceptual is inspired by the philosophy that the success of SMEs depends on new and established relationships to achieve success in business.
Based on the results of the research shown in Figure 6, it can be explained that the more women entrepreneurs in DKI Jakarta have innovative behavior in running their business, the more successful the business success of women entrepreneurs in DKI Jakarta will be. The more women entrepreneurs develop innovative attitudes in running and developing their business, the more successful the business will be. This is in line with the research conducted by Tohidi and Jabbari, (2012) shows that business success will be obtained if someone has innovative behavior. Likewise, the results of research conducted by Agustina (2014) show that innovative behavior contributes greatly to the business success of women entrepreneurs. And also from research conducted by Rahman, Setyanti, and Saleh (2015) showing that innovative behavior has a significant and positive effect on business success, where with the presence of high innovative behaviors it will also have a high influence on business success. This is because innovative behavior is all the attitudes of individuals who are directed to produce, introduce, and apply new things, which are useful in various levels of the organization to achieve business success (Agustina, 2014; Kleysen & Street, 2001).

Based on the results of the research shown in Figure 7, showing that gender stereotypes as moderating variables do not affect the relationship between business relationships and business success.

Based on the results of the research shown in Figure 8, the findings of the research in the field that gender stereotypes will weaken the innovative behavior of the business success of women entrepreneurs in DKI Jakarta. Based on the answers from respondents about their views on gender stereotypes aimed at women, there is a tendency that with the views or prejudices about the attributes or characteristics that should be possessed by women will weaken the innovative behavior's influence on business success because of the perception that women are more at risk compared to men in doing business, women do not have the same level of knowledge and ability or are stronger than men, women are seen as less active than men, and the view of creating a company is not a socially acceptable choice for women. The attributes that are attached to women who tend to be easily fooled, obedient and shy.

These views unwittingly cause female entrepreneurs to be intimidated and not confident, causing a lack of innovative behavior to explore opportunities, generativity, formative investigations, fight for, and application of innovative ideas by female entrepreneurs. However, if women entrepreneurs are able to realize the existence of these gender stereotypes and try to make changes that are capable of possessing
androgynous attributes (innovative, creative, analytical, unpredictable, active, energetic, capable of survival, leadership, and optimistic). Thus, women entrepreneurs will be able to compete and become more successful in the patriarchal business world in Indonesia.

CONCLUSIONS
In achieving business success, women entrepreneurs are expected to be able to establish good business relationships with stakeholders and continue to develop this innovative behavior because developing innovative behavior is believed to be able to foster entrepreneurial motivation for entrepreneurs to achieve success in their business. If in trying not to have a strong foundation of entrepreneurial motivation, and not having innovative behavior, it is unlikely that a business will experience growth (Azizah & Marifah, 2017; Yunul & Indriyani, 2013). In addition, women entrepreneurs must be aware of the impact of views on the characteristics and attributes that have been instilled in women. Which, unconsciously and indirectly, limits what should be done by a woman entrepreneur in running her business in order to achieve success in the business she is running. The more women entrepreneurs who have SMEs, the more they will contribute to the economy in Indonesia where this will reduce unemployment and will increase the economy in Indonesia. The business success of women entrepreneurs who have SMEs is inseparable from the ability to design marketing strategies, have financial resources in running their businesses, technology resources, access to information, business plans, and government support are factors that must be possessed in running a business to realize success in business.

Women entrepreneurs are advised not to limit themselves in pursuing business success and must be able to not be indoctrinated by the views and attributes that are pinned to women and must be aware of the adverse effects of gender stereotypes in business activities and in daily life if they want success in business. Having innovative behavior and business relationships in running a business will bring business success to female entrepreneurs. And it must be desirable to discard gender stereotypes in order to achieve business success by establishing good business relationships with anyone regardless of gender and getting used to having innovative behavior without limiting themselves.

For future research, it is better to carry out research in several regions in Indonesia. This is because each region in Indonesia has a different culture so that it is possible to give different results and is expected to involve male entrepreneurs as respondents in research, in order to compare business success between female entrepreneurs and men, based on the influence of business relationships and innovative behavior with the existence of a derivation of gender stereotypes. And it is also expected to be able to add other independent variables besides business relationships and innovative behaviors that are able to influence business success with gender stereotypes as moderating variables or control variables.

REFERENCES


and Creativity toward the Success of Entrepreneurs in Batik Batik in Kebumen Regency]. Performance, 24(2), 34-49.


the distributor perspective'. *Journal of Marketing*, 62, 99-111.


