

# FUNCTIONS AND STRATEGIES TO THE INTEGRATION OF MULTICULTURAL VALUES IN TEXTBOOK DISCOURSE FOR ELEMENTARY SCHOOL STUDENTS

Sultan<sup>1\*</sup>; Hasnawi Haris<sup>2</sup>; Anshari<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1,3</sup>Department of Indonesian Language, Faculty of Languages and Literature, Universitas Negeri Makassar

<sup>2</sup>Department of Civic Education, Faculty of Social Science, Universitas Negeri Makassar  
Jl. AP. Pettarani Makassar, Sulawesi Selatan, 90221, Indonesia

<sup>1</sup>sultan@unm.ac.id; <sup>2</sup>hasnawi.haris@unm.ac.id; <sup>3</sup>anshari@unm.ac.id

**Received:** 16<sup>th</sup> January 2020/**Revised:** 28<sup>th</sup> January 2020/**Accepted:** 03<sup>rd</sup> February 2020

**How to Cite:** Sultan., Haris. H., & Anshari. (2020). Functions and strategies to the integration of multicultural values in textbook discourse for elementary school students. *Lingua Cultura*, 14(1), 15-21. <https://doi.org/10.21512/lc.v14i1.6219>

---

## ABSTRACT

*The research was designed to reveal two crucial issues in multicultural education, namely functions and strategies to the integration of multicultural values in textbook discourse. Content analysis was employed to generate systematic and objective findings. Data were collected from textbooks used by the fourth-grade students in Indonesia and published by the Ministry of Education and Culture, Republic of Indonesia. Data collection was performed using the read-and-quote technique. Data analysis consisted of identification, categorization, and interpretation. The results of the analysis reveal that (1) multicultural values represented in textbook discourse function to build students' positive attitude towards individual, cultural, ethnic, and gender differences to instill an anti-discrimination attitude towards different ethnics, religions, races, and develop students' pride in sociocultural diversity. (2) Multicultural values are internalized through fiction, story characterization, cultural products, songs, and ethnic philosophies. Sociocultural aspects, social problems, and characteristics of the students are identified as factors that may impact on the functions and strategies to the internalization of the multicultural values.*

**Keywords:** integration values, multicultural values, textbook discourse, school student

## INTRODUCTION

Social conflict has become one of the most complex issues faced by Indonesian people lately. These conflicts, both vertical and horizontal, escalate within a variety of background causes, including political, religious, ethnic, economic, and agrarian issues (Guinness, 2015; Honna, 2012; Maddison & Diprose, 2017; Robinson, 2016). The root problems are decreased tolerance and increased intolerance behaviors among Indonesian citizens. In an attempt to anticipate these problems, multicultural education has been introduced as a solution to build civilization and harmony. The practice of multicultural education to foster tolerance and peace is an educational policy that has been included in the curriculum in several multicultural countries, such as Malaysia, Thailand, South Korea, United Kingdom, USA, and Finland

(Fry, Chun, & Apahung, 2019; Grant & Ham, 2013; Ibrahim, 2007; Johnson & Caraballo, 2019; Vorapanya & Dunlap, 2012; Zilliacus, Holm, & Sahlström, 2017).

Textbooks are an instrument that can be used to integrate multicultural values in learning. Textbooks have a broad reach and are also read repeatedly by students. Therefore, they provide benefits for the inculcation of multicultural values in them. Multicultural perspectives in textbooks are capable of helping teachers, students, and textbook authors understand diversity issues and the importance of cross-cultural understanding (Xiang & Yenika-Agbaw, 2019). Arphattananon (2018) findings show that textbook content could encourage students to live in harmony with people from different cultures. Furthermore, research conducted by Cobano-Delgado & Llorent-Bedmar (2019) have found that textbook authors seek to represent cultures that are expected to

be unveiled in the textbook. These findings confirm that textbooks have served a mediation function of multicultural knowledge to teachers and students.

Compared to other textbooks, language textbooks that are characterized by the use of discourse are more potential to transmit multicultural values. Huang (2019) has argued that language textbooks provide not only guidance in learning a language but also a platform to introduce cultural diversity and tolerance. He has identified three dimensions of textbooks that can facilitate the transformation of multicultural values; they are content dimension, incentive dimension, and interaction dimension. Textbooks that are communicative and contextual contain materials that are important and useful for language learners (content dimension). They also contain materials that can awaken students' interests and desire to learn languages (incentive dimension) and enable students to interact and communicate with others in the community (interaction dimension). These three dimensions of textbook content are relevant in instilling multicultural values. Cho and Park (2014) have found that elementary school textbooks in Korea are dominated by group identity values, recognition of cultural diversity, interdependence, and respect for human rights. Moreover, Sakki (2014) has discovered that textbooks are used as a tool to determine the national identity and national struggle. Based on these findings, it can be concluded that textbooks have been utilized as a means of transmitting multicultural values to students.

Generally, textbook researchers have attempted to uncover the form and diversity of multicultural values contained in textbook discourse (Abdou & Chan, 2017; Lee & Li, 2019; Luwihita, 2018; Muslim, 2016). In contrast to the research, the current research aims to reveal functions and strategies to the integration of multicultural values in the discourse found in language textbooks that are used by the elementary school students in Indonesia. Functions refer to goals to be achieved from the representation of multicultural values, while strategies include methods used by the textbooks' authors to integrate multicultural values into the textbooks' discourse. The study of functions and strategies to the integration of multicultural values is the key to revealing the perspectives of textbook authors. The results of the current research can be used to evaluate and develop multicultural values in a variety of subjects.

Functions and strategies to internalizing multicultural values in textbook discourse can mediate the inculcation of multicultural education in the students. Multicultural values that are represented in the textbook have specific goals and are internalized through specific ways. However, functions and strategies to internalizing multicultural values have not been revealed in the previous research. Therefore, the main problem that is going to be unveiled in the research is the functions and methods of how multicultural values are conveyed through the discourse of textbooks used by elementary school students. The

research of functions and strategies to the integration of multicultural values in textbooks is based on the assumption that the values are intentionally embedded by the authors for a particular purpose. Thus, the researchers are encouraged to apply specific strategies to achieve the goal. Awayed-Bishara (2015) has found that values integrated into English textbooks in Israel function to foster the Western-oriented Jewish-Zionist ideology. The textbooks, thus, contain materials that aim to marginalize the Palestinian Arab minority. In Germany, Ide (2016) findings show that school textbooks in Germany significantly reflect the relationship of environmental conflicts in political, media, and pop-culture discourse. Findings from these studies suggest that textbooks contain values that have ideological purposes. In the context of learning in Indonesia, studies related to the functions of multicultural values in textbook discourse have not been conducted.

The strategies for integrating multicultural values into textbook discourse are associated with the choice of medium. Moran (2001) has pointed out four strategies known as 4P by referring to products, practices, perspectives, and people. Branch (2020) has found that multicultural values can be integrated through the exploration of ethnic identity. In addition, Feng (2017) has suggested two strategies for representing social values, namely explicit representation, and implicit representation. The explicit representation strategy is literal and metaphorical, while the implicit strategy consists of the elicitation of the conditions and forms of action produced. These studies show a variety of strategies that the textbook writers have undertaken in integrating values. However, value integration strategies in textbooks produced by Indonesian authors have not been studied. The differences in cultural backgrounds, multicultural education ecosystems, and student characteristics have the potential to trigger the use of different strategies among textbook writers in Indonesia. Therefore, the research can produce a distinctive strategy in integrating multicultural values in textbook discourse.

## METHODS

Content analysis is used to reveal functions and strategies to the integration of multicultural values in textbook discourse. Content analysis is a qualitative approach which is commonly used to review problems that are rooted in a broad-scope document to generate a systematic and objective analysis (Krippendorff, 2013). The source of data is two textbooks used in elementary schools in Indonesia as primary resources for learning, entitled *Indahnya Kebersamaan* (Beauty of Togetherness) and *Berbagai Pekerjaan* (Occupations). These textbooks are officially produced and distributed by the Ministry of Education and Culture, Republic of Indonesia, as well as used by the teachers and students as the primary learning references. Expanded distribution and status of the

textbooks as official textbooks are the reason why they are selected as the research objects.

Data collection is performed using the read-and-quote technique. The analysis of functions and strategies to the integration of multicultural values into textbook discourse consists of the following steps: identification, categorization, and interpretation. Data identification is conducted by reading the textbooks' discourse repeatedly. The data of the research are collected in the form of phrases, sentences, and paragraphs that reflect the functions and strategies of the multicultural value integration. The selected data are categorized based on the functions and strategies. A data coding instrument is used to assist data categorization.

The third step in data analysis is interpretation. This activity is aimed to provide meaning to the functions and strategies of the multicultural value integration. Data interpretation is conducted in three forms, which are textual, contextual, and sociological (Gebregeorgis, 2016). The textual interpretation is made to describe the functions and strategies of multicultural value integration. At this stage, the data are interpreted at the linguistic level. The contextual interpretation is performed based on the contexts of the textbooks' stories or events. The sociological interpretation is conducted by connecting multicultural values with the social context and the encompassing culture. The validity of the data is examined using the triangulation technique and negative case analysis. The selected data are analyzed inductively and compared to substantive theories. Different findings with a common pattern are used as alternative hypotheses (Moleong, 1990).

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Multicultural values in elementary school textbook discourse represent a variety of functions. Based on data analysis, seven functions are found, namely (1) building students' positive attitudes towards individual diversity, (2) building students' positive attitudes towards cultural diversity, (3) building students' positive attitudes towards ethnic diversity, (4) building students' positive attitudes towards gender equality, (5) developing anti-discrimination attitudes towards different ethnic, religions, and races, (6) developing students' anti-conflict attitudes, and (7) developing students' pride in sociocultural diversity in Indonesia.

First, multicultural values function to build students' positive attitudes towards individual differences. Multicultural values represented in the textbook discourse serve to shape students' tolerance for diverse individual characteristics. Each individual is described as unique and different from others. This value function is shown in datum (1). In datum (1), multicultural values represented by the textbook authors serve to build students' tolerant attitudes by showing that each individual is unique. The author would like to

highlight the fact that individual differences are a gift from God and build student awareness that differences can be potential if addressed wisely.

- (1) God bestows people with different gifts. The gifts can be in the form of talents, characters, and abilities. These differences allow humans to work together and complement each other. (FN/MSTS-KI)

Second, multicultural values function to build students' positive attitudes towards cultural diversity. Multicultural values represented in the textbook discourse serve to shape students' tolerance for cultural diversity. This value function is shown in the following datum (2). In datum (2), multicultural values represented by the writer serves to build students' tolerance towards Indonesian culture. Indonesian people are required to accept diversity because there are many different cultures and customs found in the country. Diversity is a force that must be preserved.

- (2) Our homeland, Indonesia, is very diverse in traditional houses, traditional clothing, musical instruments, dances, and even food. We must be grateful for God's gift by looking after it and preserving it. (FN/MSTS-KB)

Third, multicultural values function to build students' positive attitudes towards ethnic diversity. Multicultural values represented in the textbook discourse serve to shape students' tolerance for ethnic diversity. This value function is shown in datum (3). In datum (3), Indonesia is portrayed as having ethnic diversity. Such diversity can be either beneficial or even detrimental to intolerant communities. This value representation aims to build awareness among citizens to respect ethnic differences. The author emphasizes that diversity is not a human will, but God's will.

- (3) Indonesia consists of various ethnicities and cultures that are accommodated in one place, the Republic of Indonesia (NKRI). Diversity is a gift from God Almighty, so we need to be grateful for it. (FN/MSTS-KE)

Fourth, multicultural values function to build students' positive attitudes towards gender equality. Multicultural values represented in the textbook discourse serve to shape students' tolerance for gender equality. This value function is shown in datum (4). In this datum, multicultural values represented serve to raise students' awareness of God's creation of sex dichotomy. The textbook writer invites the students to realize that men and women are equal so that they should be treated equally. Therefore, the dichotomy does not need to be questioned.

Fifth, multicultural values function to build students' anti-discrimination, anti-ethnic, anti-religion, and anti-race attitudes. Multicultural values represented in the textbook discourse serve to shape students' anti-

discrimination attitudes towards different ethnicities/religions/races. This value function is shown in datum (5). In this datum, multicultural values represented in the textbook discourse function to form anti-discrimination attitudes towards different ethnicities by giving equal treatment to other individuals/groups regardless of ethnicity. The author stresses that, in reality, most individuals/groups often react differently toward different ethnicity. Such actions are contrary to multicultural values.

- (4) In essence, humans are created by God as male and female. Men and women have their differences or uniqueness, but God creates both of them. Men and women are created to complement each other. (FN/MSTS-KG02)
- (5) This story teaches us how to care and love others. It also teaches the value of selflessness. A caring attitude will also attract love and care from others. In general, people care more about the people they know or the people who share a common background with them, for example, ethnicity, race, religion, or origin. And people care less about strangers because they do not have the same background as them and they are considered useless for them. (FN/MS-AE)

Sixth, multicultural values function to build students' anti-conflict attitudes. Multicultural values represented in the textbook discourse serve to shape students' anti-conflict attitudes. This value function is shown in datum (6). This value representation aims to build the awareness that an atmosphere of peace can be created through the minimization of individual differences and the establishment of mutual respect. The author would like to encourage every student to avoid conflict that may be created due to the differences in social background.

- (6) Each member of society respects each other and glorifies each other. In order to avoid divisions between members, each member must pay attention to each other. If the relationship built among the members is harmonious, then one's pain will be everyone's pain. All members must work together to build a better life. (FN/MS-AK).

Seventh, multicultural values function to develop students' pride towards Indonesian socio-cultural differences. Multicultural values represented in the textbook discourse motivate the students to develop pride in national diversity. This value function is shown in datum (7). Multicultural values represented in the textbook discourse aim to develop students' pride in national diversity. The function of building this value is so important. Each student needs to see the differences from positive aspects. Thus, it is hoped that in social life, they can take positive action in dealing with diversity.

- (7) As an Indonesian child, I feel proud of the diversity that exists in Indonesia. (FN/MS-KPDS)

The internalization of multicultural values in textbook discourse is conducted through a variety of strategies. Based on data analysis, five strategies are found to internalize multicultural values, namely (1) internalizing multicultural values through fictions, (2) internalizing multicultural values through story characterization, (3) internalizing multicultural values through the descriptions of cultural products, (4) internalizing multicultural values through songs, and (5) internalizing multicultural values through ethnic philosophies.

First, the strategy used to internalize multicultural values is through fiction. Multicultural values in the textbooks are internalized through fables. This internalization strategy is shown in datum (8).

- (8) Winter was here at last. The diligent Ant sat comfortably in his warm house while enjoying his abundant food, while the Grasshopper was contemplating his sadness at home because he did not have any food at all. When the Grasshopper was almost starving to death, the Ant came and offered him food. Since then, the Grasshopper had become as diligent as the Ant at collecting food. (SI/INM-CF)

In datum (8), the textbook's author utilizes figures in fiction to demonstrate multicultural values to the students. The Ant and the Grasshopper are portrayed as two different characters that are willing to help each other. This strategy is used to ensure that multicultural messages could be delivered smoothly to the children. Elementary schools are typically made up of young learners or children who favor stories. Therefore, the author utilizes stories as a medium to convey multicultural values to the students.

Second, the strategy used to internalize multicultural values is through story characterization. Multicultural values in the textbooks are internalized through different characters in a story. This internalization strategy is shown in datum (9).

- (9) Humans are social creatures. They make friends with each other. Humans cannot live alone as they need others to meet their needs. Without farmers, fishermen cannot get rice, corn, etc. Conversely, without fishermen, farmers cannot get fish, salt, and others. Both have a vital role in building a healthier and stronger life. Cooperation between humans is a necessity in life because each of us has uniqueness and different preferences of work. (SI/INM-PT)

In datum (9), the author internalizes multicultural values through the different roles of each character to create interdependence. Through this strategy, different roles are described as equally important because they provide benefits to everyone. Individuals need to play

different roles in order to meet human needs. The author would like to teach the students that different roles are needed in life.

Third, the strategy used to internalize multicultural values is through cultural product descriptions. Multicultural values in the textbooks are internalized through the descriptions of cultural products. This internalization strategy is shown in data (10) and (11).

(10) Tari kipas pakarena is a dance art originating from Gowa, South Sulawesi. This dance has become a tradition among the people in Gowa, who used to be the Kingdom of Gowa. (SI/INM-DPB02)

(11) The diversity of Indonesian culture is also seen in traditional fabric. The fabric is designed with different motifs and colors, so it looks beautiful and attractive. Let us observe the following traditional/folk costume. (SI/INM-DPB03)

In data (10) and (11), the author internalizes multicultural values through the descriptions of diverse ethnic, cultural products, namely traditional houses, dances, and fabrics. The author would like to show to the students that Indonesia has a variety of cultures that represent different ethnicities. Such diversity should be accepted as national wealth.

Fourth, the strategy used to internalize multicultural values is through songs. Multicultural values in the textbooks are internalized in messages delivered through songs. This internalization strategy is shown in datum (12).

(12) I am an Indonesian// an independent child// One country// One nation// Indonesia. (SI/INM-L)

In datum (12), multicultural values are internalized through the moral message of the song that mentioned, even though Indonesia has diverse cultures, it is united by a national bond. This strategy is chosen to promote the spirit of national unity in students. Using songs to deliver messages is selected by the author as the strategy to inculcating multicultural values in elementary school students or children who love songs as a medium of learning.

Fifth, the strategy used to internalize multicultural values is through ethnic philosophies. Multicultural values in the textbooks are internalized through ethnic philosophies that teach specific lessons to individuals or groups. This internalization strategy is shown in datum (13).

In datum (13), the internalization of multicultural values is done by displaying Minangkabau ethnic philosophy. Every ethnic believes in a set of noble values that can teach a lesson for everyone. By introducing an ethnic philosophy, the textbook author has essentially introduced an ethnic culture to the students. Thus, it is hoped that mutual understanding, tolerance, and respect for diversity can be built within

the students.

(13) Minang people like to trade and migrate to other areas. They are always determined to achieve success in every area visited. Quite often, they offer help to other people who need it. (SI/INM-FE)

The results of the research show that discourse in language textbooks used by elementary school students in Indonesia represent a variety of functions and strategies. The functions of these values include the development of positive characters and attitudes towards individual diversity, cultural diversity, ethnic diversity, gender equality, and conflict (anti-conflict attitudes). The results indicate that the textbooks' authors focus mainly on building the students' positive attitudes towards cultural diversity in Indonesia. This is shown in a number of examples that originate from a high amount of cultural wealth. This finding is in line with Noe et al. (2018), who have conducted research in the Banuroja community. They have found that multicultural values in the community function to build social integrity and emphasized the identity of cultural diversity, respect for diversity, and the application of these principles in multicultural life.

Findings from the research that emphasize the function of 'building students' positive attitudes towards cultural diversity' are based on sociocultural aspects and social problems faced by the Indonesian people recently. Indonesia is a nation with diverse cultures. Therefore, the textbook authors adopt this value to shape students' tolerance. The majority of social problems faced by the Indonesian people stem from cultural, ethnic, and religious clashes. Therefore, textbooks are positioned by the authors as media through which students' social awareness and students' tolerant character can be built.

The multicultural values represented in the textbooks contain narratives and explorations of cultural diversity. It appears that the authors of the books are trying to make a connection between social practices and textbook discourse. This finding is corroborated with those by Branch (2020), who suggests four forms of ethnic identity explorations in education; they include connection, discourse, exploration, and role models. The textbooks' authors invite the students to explore ethnic traditions and cultures. They also introduce the traditions and cultures as a medium of multicultural education.

Based on the analysis conducted in the research, it can be concluded that the functions represented in the textbooks are diverse, relevant, and easily understood by the students. In general, multicultural values integrate into the textbooks that have the function to promote cross-cultural understanding, build pride in diversity, establish respect for individual and group differences, and instill anti-conflict attitudes in students. Similarly, Sleeter (2010) has proposed an ideal conception of multicultural education that values cultural differences, builds anti-discrimination

attitudes, and emphasizes social justice.

Another aspect that indicates the superiority of the function of multicultural values can be seen in the function of building students' positive attitudes towards gender equality. Multicultural values have found in the textbooks also aim to foster students' anti-discrimination attitudes towards gender differences. On the contrary, Adel and Enayat (2016) have revealed that textbooks tend to institutionalize gender discrimination and disadvantage women. Gender justice discourse has been developed massively, and the competence of writers related to gender justice is believed to be an influential factor. Another factor that may impact on the distinguished results of the research is the social background of the community. The Indonesian culture and Arabic culture are different in terms of male and female social roles.

The findings of the research also show that fiction, story characterization, cultural products, songs, and ethnic philosophies are used as media for the representation of multicultural values. The findings indicate that the textbook authors use a content integration approach to internalize multicultural values. This approach is basic by utilizing data and cultural diversity. If it is based on the opinion of Banks (1993), the development model of multicultural values in Indonesian primary school textbooks is categorized into the contribution approach. Content integration and contribution approach are the most basic models in multicultural education. In the context of textbooks in Indonesia, this is relevant because multicultural discourse is still relatively new so that its implementation starts from the most essential aspect.

From the cultural value perspective, four categories are used by textbook writers as media representations, namely products, practices, perspectives, and people. Among the four categories, the most dominant category is cultural products. This is consistent with the findings of Moran (2001), who has revealed that cultural products are the media most often found in textbooks, while perspective is the most popular step found in textbooks. The characteristics of the elementary school students who learn through concrete things are relevant to this value representation strategy. Cultural products that are used as examples will be easily understood by the students. On the other hand, abstract perspectives will create barriers to the multicultural value acquisition.

## CONCLUSIONS

The results of the research show that the textbook discourse in elementary schools represents a variety of multicultural value functions and strategies. Multicultural values represented have a function to build positive attitudes of students towards the diversity of individual characteristics, cultures, ethnicities, gender; to instill anti-discrimination attitudes towards different ethnicities, religions, and racial; and develop students' anti-conflict attitudes as well as students'

pride in socio-cultural diversity. The representation of the multicultural value functions in the textbook discourse indicates that the writers attempt to focus on building students' positive attitudes towards aspects of cultural diversity. It can be concluded that the textbooks' authors are motivated by the socio-cultural aspects and social problems faced by the Indonesian people.

Multicultural values are integrated into the textbooks through a variety of strategies, namely value internalization through fictions, story characterization, cultural products, songs, and ethnic philosophies. This finding confirms that multicultural values can be represented in various ways. The choice of the value internalization strategy strongly depends on the multicultural education discourse in Indonesia that is still relatively new. The implementation of the discourse should start from the basic aspects and characteristics of the students as beginner learners that are relevant to those strategies.

The research is limited to only the functions and strategies of multicultural value internalization in textbook discourse. The effect of value internalization on students' behaviors is important aspects that have not been revealed in the research. The other limitation of the research is the coverage as it only involved elementary textbooks as the research objects. Further research is needed to uncover the functions and strategies to the integration of multicultural values in a more comprehensive context. Researchers need to pay more attention to the analysis of textbooks for junior and senior high school students. Training models for embedding multicultural values in textbooks also need to be explicitly examined. Another area that needs to be investigated in the future is the level of teacher understanding of multicultural values in textbooks and learning strategies used by the teacher in an attempt to incorporate these values into the learning process.

## REFERENCES

- Abdou, E. D., & Chan, W. Y. A. (2017). Analyzing constructions of polytheistic and monotheistic religious traditions: A critical multicultural approach to textbooks in Quebec. *Multicultural Perspectives*, 19(1), 16-25. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15210960.2016.1263961>.
- Adel, S. M. R., & Enayat, M. J. (2016). Gender representation and stereotyping in ESP textbooks. *The Asian ESP Journal*, 12(3), 94-119.
- Arphattananon, T. (2018). Multicultural education in Thailand. *Intercultural Education*, 29(2), 149-162. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14675986.2018.1430020>.
- Awayed-Bishara, M. (2015). Analyzing the cultural content of materials used for teaching English to high school speakers of Arabic in Israel. *Discourse and Society*, 26(4), 517-542. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0957926515581154>.
- Banks, J. A. (1993). *An introduction to multicultural education*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

- Branch, A. J. (2020). Promoting ethnic identity development while teaching subject matter content: A model of ethnic identity exploration in education. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 87, 1-11. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2019.102918>.
- Cho, Y., & Park, Y. (2014). Textbook as a contradictory meltingpot: An analysis of multicultural content in Korean textbooks. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 36(1), 111-130. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2014.924388>.
- Cobano-Delgado, V. C., & Llorent-Bedmar, V. (2019). Identity and gender in childhood: Representation of Moroccan women in textbooks. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 74, 137-142. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2019.03.011>.
- Feng, W. D. (2017). Infusing moral education into English language teaching: An ontogenetic analysis of social values in EFL textbooks in Hong Kong. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 40(4), 458-473. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01596306.2017.1356806>.
- Fry, G. W., Chun, H., & Apahung, R. (2019). Responding to accelerating multicultural challenges: Comparative cultural democracy in Korea and Thailand. *Multicultural Education Review*, 11(4), 271-295. <https://doi.org/10.1080/2005615x.2019.1686565>.
- Gebregeorgis, M. Y. (2016). Peace values in language textbooks: The case of English for Ethiopia student textbook. *Journal of Peace Education*, 14(1), 54-68. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17400201.2016.1228526>.
- Grant, C. A., & Ham, S. (2013). Multicultural education policy in South Korea: Current struggles and hopeful vision. *Multicultural Education Review*, 5(1), 67-95. <https://doi.org/10.1080/2005615x.2013.11102898>.
- Guinness, P. (2015). Religion, community, and conflict in Indonesia: Reflections on Chris Duncan's violence and vengeance. *The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology*, 16(1), 74-83. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14442213.2014.983447>.
- Honna, J. (2012). Inside the Democrat Party: Power, politics and conflict in Indonesia's presidential party. *South East Asia Research*, 20(4), 473-489. <https://doi.org/10.5367/sear.2012.0125>.
- Huang, P. (2019). Textbook interaction: A study of the language and cultural contextualisation of English learning textbooks. *Learning, Culture and Social Interaction*, 21, 87-99. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lcsi.2019.02.006>.
- Ibrahim, R. (2007). Multiculturalism and education in Malaysia. *Culture and Religion*, 8(2), 155-167. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14755610701424024>.
- Ide, T. (2016). Critical geopolitics and school textbooks: The case of environment-conflict links in Germany. *Political Geography*, 55, 60-71. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.polgeo.2016.07.002>.
- Johnson, L., & Caraballo, L. (2019). Multicultural education in the US and UK in the 1980s and beyond: The role of interest convergence-divergence. *Multicultural Education Review*, 11(3), 155-171. <https://doi.org/10.1080/2005615X.2019.1644040>.
- Krippendorff, K. H. (2013). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology*. California: Sage Publications.
- Lee, J. F. K., & Li, X. (2019). Cultural representation in English language textbooks: A comparison of textbooks used in mainland China and Hong Kong. *Pedagogy, Culture & Society*, 1-19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14681366.2019.1681495>.
- Luwihita, A. D. (2018). Analisis nilai-nilai multikultural dalam buku teks siswa mata pelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam (PAI) Kelas VII SMP. *Dinamika*, 3(2), 109-132.
- Maddison, S., & Diprose, R. (2017). Conflict dynamics and agonistic dialogue on historical violence: A case from Indonesia. *Third World Quarterly*, 39(8), 1622-1639. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01436597.2017.1374837>.
- Moleong, L. J. (1990). *Metode penelitian kualitatif*. Bandung: Rosdakarya.
- Moran, P. (2001). *Teaching culture: Perspectives in practice*. Boston: Heinle and Heinle.
- Muslim. (2016). Nilai-nilai pendidikan multikultural dalam buku teks Bahasa Indonesia untuk Siswa SMP. *Riksa Bahasa*, 2(1), 55-66.
- Noe, W., Affandi, I., Malihah, E., & Sunatra. (2018). The dynamics of multicultural values of Banuroja community in building social integration a socio-cultural ethnographic study in Gorontalo. *Journal of Human Behavior in the Social Environment*, 28(6), 758-770. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10911359.2018.1458680>.
- Robinson, K. (2016). Communal peace and conflict in Indonesia: Navigating inter-religious boundaries. *The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology*, 17(5), 475-479. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14442213.2016.1217761>.
- Sakki, I. (2014). Social representations of European integration as narrated by school textbooks in five European nations. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 43, 35-47. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijintrel.2014.08.010>.
- Sleeter, C. E. (2010). Probing beneath meanings of multicultural education. *Multicultural Education Review*, 2(1), 1-24. <https://doi.org/10.1080/2005615x.2010.11102867>.
- Vorapanya, S., & Dunlap, D. (2012). Inclusive education in Thailand: Practices and challenges. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 18(10), 1014-1028. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2012.693400>.
- Xiang, R., & Yenika-Agbaw, V. (2019). EFL textbooks, culture, and power: A critical content analysis of EFL textbooks for ethnic Mongols in China. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2019.1692024>.
- Zilliacus, H., Holm, G., & Sahlström, F. (2017). Taking steps towards institutionalising multicultural education: The national curriculum of Finland. *Multicultural Education Review*, 9(4), 231-248. <https://doi.org/10.1080/2005615x.2017.1383810>.