DEFINING THE SENSE OF PLACE COMPONENTS IN THE FOOD AND CRAFT MARKET AT THE WORLD HERITAGE SITE

Astrid Kusumowidagdo1*; Trianggoro Wiradinata2; Melania Rahadiyanti3; Dyah Kusuma Wardhani4; Cicilia Larasati Rembulan5

1-5 Interior Architecture, School of Creative Industry, Ciputra University
CitraLand CBD Boulevard, Made, Kec. Sambikerep, Kota SBY, Jawa Timur 60219, Indonesia
1astrid@ciputra.ac.id; 2twiradinata@ciputra.ac.id; 3melania.rahadiyanti@ciputra.ac.id; 4dyah.wardhani@ciputra.ac.id; 5crembulan@ciputra.ac.id

Received: 05th October 2021/ Revised: 02nd February 2022/ Accepted: 02nd February 2022


ABSTRACT

The research aimed to strengthen the future sense of place by focusing on the sense of place components, namely, physical, social, personal, and shared meaning aspects, as input to local stakeholders. The sense of place of Borobudur Temple stimulated visitors to attend the tourism area at the heritage site, whose potential could be strengthened by promoting the local creative economy and its identity. The research provided theoretical benefits as a basis for further research and practical benefits as input for stakeholders to strengthen the identity of heritage areas. The research was a solution to preserving the historical value of this region in both physical and social aspects in order to strengthen the place’s character as the stalwart of the Borobudur area as a world heritage artifact. The discoveries would clear up the area’s function as Borobudur’s shopping excursion area in a local identity context. Data were collected through structured observation, in-depth online interviews, photos, videos, literature studies, and a manual data analysis procedure. The results show that physical attributes, such as site, build form, and landmark, need improvements. Moreover, social interaction, pedestrian flows, product, personal and shared meanings, comprising history, narration, and event and promotion, should be improved. Further studies should focus on how to improve architecture, modern product variations, and local music. Furthermore, the sense of place will be increased by understanding the services cape of Borobudur Food and Craft Market.

Keywords: sense of place, physical aspect, food market, craft market

INTRODUCTION

Every place has a special character, including the Borobudur temple, which evokes certain feelings and impressions from visitors, showing its spirit and stimulus. Borobudur is the largest temple in Indonesia, officially designated by UNESCO as a world cultural heritage site with Word Heritage List C 592 in 1991.

According to the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy, this area and its surroundings are a super-priority region for Indonesian tourism. Therefore, the government needs to conserve its presentation and socio-economic resilience. This means that the development of socio-cultural potential into a creative economy needs to be considered by focusing on and improving the value provided by the Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB).

The proper sense of place management of Borobudur and its supporting areas strengthens its identity that provides an attachment/relationship between visitors and this area to make their next visit. Therefore, this research examines the components forming a sense of place in the Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB).

The sense of place that promotes the relationship of visitors to the sense of place has been widely studied. For instance, Artemenko and Artemenko (2018), Lynch (1960), and Peláez (2018) have
provided a mental image regarding the imageability of a city. According to Lynch (1960), the city’s image shows elements that strengthen the area’s identity and sense of place, comprising pathways, edges, districts, nodes, and landmarks. Furthermore, Canter (1977), Hashemnezhad, Heidari, and Hoseini (2013), Montgomery (1998), Najafi & Shariff (2011), Relph (1976), Schulz (1980), Tuan (1977), Ujang, Moulay, and Zakaria (2018) have strengthened the research related to a sense of place.

Previous research shows that the sense of place could be intangible or tangible in physical attributes, social activities, and personal and shared meanings. Physical attribute factors contributing to the sense of place (Canter, 1977; Hashemnezhad, Heidari, & Hoseini, 2013; Montgomery, 1998; Najafi & Shariff, 2011; Punter, 1991; Relph, 1976; Schulz, 1980; Tuan, 1977) are built from the landscape, furniture, permeability, intensity, scale, landmarks, and public realms. Social factors include perception of the environmental perception, being with others, attractors, events and local tradition, café culture, people watching, street life, vitality, diversity, noise, smell, and behavior (Canter, 1977; Hashemnezhad, Heidari, & Hoseini, 2013; Montgomery, 1998; Najafi & Shariff, 2011; Punter, 1991; Relph, 1976; Schulz, 1980; Tuan, 1977). Furthermore, another factor is personal and shared meanings (Canter, 1977; Hashemnezhad, Heidari, & Hoseini, 2013; Montgomery, 1998; Najafi & Shariff, 2011; Punter, 1991; Relph, 1976; Schulz, 1980; Tuan, 1977). Furthermore, another word ‘case’ refers to individuals, groups, events, phenomena, and behaviors (Yin, 2011). However, the research uses a single case because its existence and environment are unique to be considered an object (Kusumowidagdo & Wardhani, 2017).

The research uses a single case of the Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) with an analysis unit of physical and social factors that form a sense of place. SKMB is the intended object because it increases the sense of place and the competitive advantage of super-priority tourist areas. Data are collected from structured observations and in-depth online interviews with eight respondents, consisting of one researcher and two managers. Furthermore, other sources used are secondary data from photo documentation, videos, related media reports, and literature studies. Data analysis involves reduction, presentation, verification, and triangulation (Moleong, 2018). Triangulation of data sources is used for research validity (Afiansyu & Mariyani, 2020). A list of questions for managers and researcher is in Table 1.

### METHODS

The research was conducted from March to July 2021 applying a qualitative method. The qualitative method aims to explore the research goals inductively and to transform specific observed cases. Creswell and Poth (2016) have provided a broader descriptive picture of the object (Moleong, 2018) using a case study method (Yin, 2011). This method is used to investigate and examine the real-life phenomenon creation of public spaces through tourism markets. The word ‘case’ refers to individuals, groups, events, phenomena, and behaviors (Yin, 2011). However, the research uses a single case because its existence and environment are unique to be considered an object (Kusumowidagdo & Wardhani, 2017).

The research uses a single case of the Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) with an analysis unit of physical and social factors that form a sense of place. SKMB is the intended object because it increases the sense of place and the competitive advantage of super-priority tourist areas. Data are collected from structured observations and in-depth online interviews with eight respondents, consisting of one researcher and two managers. Furthermore, other sources used are secondary data from photo documentation, videos, related media reports, and literature studies. Data analysis involves reduction, presentation, verification, and triangulation (Moleong, 2018). Triangulation of data sources is used for research validity (Afiansyu & Mariyani, 2020). A list of questions for managers and researcher is in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>What do you think about the Borobudur food and craft market (Sentra Kerajinan Makanan Borobudur/ SKMB) Area?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>How can Borobudur food and craft market (SKMB) support the existence of the Borobudur temple? What values are offered?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>What is the future policy for this area?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>How does the government support the development of this area?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>How is community participation in the development of this area?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>What are the tangible aspects of the place being developed?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>What are some other non-physical aspects that get attention?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>How do Borobudur food and craft market (SKMB) managers create an attractive shopping experience for tourists?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>What is unique about the SKMB Corridor compared to shopping corridors in other tourist attractions?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>What is the area of the Borobudur food and craft market (SKMB)? How are the sectors divided? Are there interesting points planned in these areas?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) has many uniqueness as the research object. There are new goals besides site preservation as stated in the Integrated Tourism Master Plan for the Borobudur, Yogyakarta, and Prambanan areas. Also, there are new measures to reduce the burden on the Borobudur temple, providing experiences for other attractions, promoting local economic growth, accommodating visitors’ wishes, strengthening local values, and preserving nature.

Borobudur is a temple site for Buddhists whose construction began around 758 AD. The process involves constructing the temple terrace and expanding the stupa. The large stupa is changed to a three-step terrace surrounded by small and large stupas at the top; then, the relief is changed without altering its meaning. The long-abandoned Borobudur Temple was rediscovered during the Dutch occupation in 1814 and later restored in 1907-1911. After independence, from 1973 to 1983, the Indonesian Government and UNESCO carried out a comprehensive overhaul. UNESCO included it as a World Heritage Site in 1980. Borobudur was also damaged by a bomb in 1985 and an earthquake in 2006, though it could be rehabilitated.

In line with the 1979 Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) master plan in the Integrated Tourism Master Plan Document for this area with the big theme Twin Park of Mid Java, there are five zones in global development. They include zones 1 (temple development), 2 (Borobudur archeology), 3 (settlement development/Pawon and Mendut temples), and other archaeological objects. Furthermore, there are visitor facility development, zones 4 (historical panorama preservation area), and 5 (national archaeological park). There have been various directives for land use that should be controlled. The arrangement of areas within this temple has been planned in Presidential Regulation No. 58 of 2014, the Minister of Education and Culture Decree No. 286/M/2014 concerning the geographical spatial unit of Borobudur. The National Spatial Plan, the Central Java Spatial and Regional Plan, the Magelang Regency Spatial and Regional Plan, and Detailed Spatial, Territory Plans, and Layouts consider all aspects that could impact the Borobudur landscape.

The Borobudur area is managed by three stakeholders, while the authority division is regulated in Zone 1 by Balai Konservasi Borobudur (BKB) for temple preservation and Zone 2 by PT Taman Wisata Candi (TWC). Moreover, Tourism Park for Borobudur (TWC), Prambanan, and Ratu Boko Temples is the purpose of utilization, and Zone 3 by the Magelang local government focuses on development. Therefore, zone 2, covering the Borobudur Craft and Food Center, is managed by PT TWC. There is a plan to move Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) to improve the area’s visuals and image and the relationship with visitors coming in 2023.

The Indonesian government has a continuous master plan to develop Borobudur, divided into these zones. In the future, the SKMB would be relocated considering inputs from various observations because the management has planned for its development.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

The research has found a sense of place components, including physical, activities, and shared meanings through interviews, observation, and sharing of other literature studies. The following findings are the main points of qualitative exploration. The first component of the sense of place is the physical factors that form the SKMB’s sense of place: the site, architecture, and landmark, as described in the following section.

For site, the SKMB is located in the sub-district of Borobudur in Magelang regency, covering 5,518 Ha. It is a virtual line with Mendut and Pawon temples and a unified landscape with the Elo and Progo rivers, culturally blending with Dagi and Menoreh hills. This site has four divisions, with the Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) in the second area, managed by PT Taman Wisata Candi Borobudur under the Ministry of State Owned Enterprise (SOE), aims to increase revenue. It supports Borobudur Temple to increase the state and the community income and focuses on local potential.

This is a support area for Borobudur temple with a greater position in creating a sense of place. Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) is strongly influenced by the condition of the Borobudur temple. Figure 1 shows the site entrance of the Borobudur temple area.

![Figure 1 Site Entrance of the Borobudur Temple Area](Source: Private Photo)

It was not until 1980 that the area of Borobudur was organized like today. Therefore, as an effort to preserve the environment, the government appoints the TWC Company to become responsible for managing the building and resource maintenance as well as preserving the culture. Hence, some facilities were built for that purpose, such as tourism facilities, education centers, and shopping areas, including Food and Crafts Center, which was built in 2009. SKMB (Figure 2) is an area with non-permanent buildings and linear circulation with fairly long corridors and shops owned by local people. A simple display appears at every merchant outlet, while the
roof without a ceiling is not equipped with natural lighting, ventilation, and asbestos material. The outlets are not too big, with a tight layout that accommodates the products traded. The simple layout features a flat table display in the front area and hanging displays on the right and left. The front display is usually made of terraces to reinforce various small products. In the open storefront area, it is not uncommon to use floor coverings in paving, and certain parts of the surface are uneven. These shops are arranged back-to-back, with a linear circulation measuring 2 m x 2 m.

The second component is the sense of place; the social components making up the Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB)'s sense of place are the interaction of traders and visitors, the atmosphere of pedestrian flow, and the products traded, as explained in the following section. The interaction of traders and tourists as visitors contributes a lot to the social component of a sense of place. As a super-priority tourism destination, Borobudur temple provides many opportunities for the local residents to participate in improving their economy by becoming a merchant in the area of the Food and Craft Center.

Merchants in the Borobudur area appreciate and occupy the area because they see the number of tourists and the opportunity to improve their economic condition. The TWC Company, the manager of this tourism destination, has provided opportunities to the local people surrounding the area to become entrepreneurs in the Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) area by selling various products and owning kiosks. During its development, people who initially chose to become farmers in the surrounding area quit and decided to become merchants in the tourism area of Borobudur. Until now, many of the merchants have owned their stores or kiosks for generations. This proves that there is an opportunity provided for local people to manage a shop in the area that they can take advantage of, so they can live a better life than before.

Social interaction in this context is a dynamic social relationship. In this context, it links the relationship between merchants and visitors. The existence of the Borobudur temple is a social life for merchants. Their typical behavior is seen during activities of offering and promoting products to potential buyers. The merchants attempt to promote all products characterized by the tourist area, Borobudur, or with the name Borobudur printed on the products.

Tourists usually get information about the Borobudur Temple Tourism Park from social media, newspapers and other media, relatives, and travel agents. Related to those information, they usually visit the Borobudur area in groups or with their family.

International tourists who come to the Borobudur area are usually from the Netherlands, Malaysia, France, China, and Germany (Ayurin, 2020). Besides them, local tourists also crowd the area. Domestic visitors come with their families during the year-end holidays, especially during Christmas, New Year’s, and school holidays. The actual motivations for them visiting the area are the uniqueness of the Borobudur Temple Tourism Park, historical motivation, religious motivation, and recreational motivation. In addition to that, they also enjoy shopping for local products in the Food and Crafts Center area.

Another typical behavior is the merchants’ skill to communicate in foreign languages. Some merchants even try to master several languages, such as English and Japanese. They learn those languages from international visitors and the merchant community (Ayurin, 2020). Conversation moisture is usually warm and mixed with the sounds of Indonesian and...
Javanese, and discounts are given to visitors buying in large quantities. Few traders speak fluent English but communicate enough to discuss prices and offer their products less supportively.

Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) is closed during the COVID-19 pandemic and reopened with an odd-even system, with fewer visitors than before, making the area rely more on local tourists. Furthermore, they use strict health procedures in their interactions, such as wearing masks. Figure 4 shows the interaction of traders and visitors.

![Figure 4 Interaction of Traders and Visitors](Source: Private Photo)

Pedestrian flows also have an impact on the social dimension. Pedestrians walk slowly to look around the merchandise. The asbestos roof gives the impression of a higher temperature than the surroundings, though the weather in Magelang is relatively cool, between 19 to 31 degrees. Moreover, the atmosphere is quite lively, with the chatter of traders in Javanese coloring the trip. Figure 5 shows the interaction of pedestrian flows.

![Figure 5 Interaction of Pedestrian Flows](Source: Private Photo)

The merchandise products are quite diverse but related to the background of the Borobudur temple and various local and regional products (Listiana, 2005). The types of products sold are handicrafts (Figure 6), such as wooden handicraft products, pottery, temple miniatures, and various t-shirts with the Borobudur icon. Also, there are dry and durable foods brought as souvenirs from visitors. Most of the products purchased are light souvenirs that could be carried in large quantities. However, tourists often buy local products of pottery and exotic miniatures of the Borobudur Temple.

Sales are set at low prices when only a few visitors are seen passing through the Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB). Meanwhile, prices can be set very high. That means the price fluctuates in Food and Crafts Market since merchants will set the price based on visitors’ physical appearances and characteristics; for example, the price can be different for domestic visitors and international visitors. Food products that could be eaten immediately are sold in separate stalls near this complex. They are less specific, such as meatballs and soto. However, this is a special attraction for visitors outside Java.

![Figure 6 Handicraft Products](Source: Private Photo)

Third components of sense of place, some shared meanings of SKMB are cultural history, narration, and events held in the area. In Cultural Historical, Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) was not included in the temple section as part of the past. However, there is a management plan to support the Borobudur temple as the main attraction and provide other attractions and experiences or strengthen the remembered image by purchasing souvenirs and other items. Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) belongs to the cultural preservation zone (zone 2), built by residents with about 3,000 traders and accessible when leaving the temple. Additionally, it has burned down in its history but was later relocated and properly repaired. It can be seen in Figure 7.

![Figure 7 Borobudur Area and Its Development](Source: Private Photo)
Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) narration is related to the Borobudur temple story. Borobudur is a temple object that has become one with a landscape with a stepped pyramid shape and many past stories. It consists of ten terraces in ascending order, with wall reliefs telling *Karmavibhanga*.

The division of the temple into legs, body, and structure is in line with the conception of nature in Buddhism. It is believed that the universe has three hierarchies, *Kamadhatu, Rupadhatu*, and *Arupadhatu*, representing human form and worldly desires, humans that begin to die but are still bound by name and form, and free humans could leave the world, its name, and form.

As an object in the unified landscape, the natural environment of the Borobudur area is analogous to the universe system in Buddhism. Borobudur temple, with the formation of a mountain/Meru, symbolizes the mandala.

Furthermore, it is a sacred place that reminds humans of the universe with the purpose is for enlightenment and a better life. Merapi, Andong, Tidar, Sumbing Sindoro, and Menorah are a series of mountains. The water circle is represented by the flow of rivers around the Borobudur temple, including the Progo, Elo, and Sileng rivers, with their tributaries. Also, there is a lake associated with *Meru* called lake Anavatapta. Figure 8 shows reliefs on the Borobudur temple.

From a macro perspective, this landscape is a cosmographic unity and places the temple peak as the center and reference point, with a relationship between its aspects, giving the impression of perfect order. This narrative attracts visitors and provides value for its sense of place. Many attractions or events at the Borobudur temple also impact the Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) area, with religious nuances and those supporting tourism. Originally, all events and attractions managed in the Borobudur area focus on the Borobudur temple.

However, those events and attractions that highlight various aspects of the Borobudur temple also affect the Food and Crafts Market. Some of the events that also become attractions for the visitors are the Three-day Vesak, the Borobudur International Festival, the Borobudur Masterpiece Colossal Dance Performance, and Sunrise (Ambarwati, 2016). These events also energize the Food and Crafts Center located at the Borobudur exit.

Vesak is celebrated once a year, usually in May. This festival commemorates three significant moments of Siddhārtha Gautama Buddha. The first significant moment is Siddhārtha Gautama’s birth in 623 SM. The second is the enlightenment moment when the prince became Buddha. The third is the death of Gautama Buddha. This event consists of many sacred rituals such are, among others, obtaining holy water from the Temanggung district, torch lighting, and almsgiving. Marking the end of the rituals is releasing lanterns into the sky.

The Borobudur International Festival aims to promote Indonesian culture and tourism in the Borobudur temple area through art performances and international exhibitions on Indonesian cultural heritage and tourism. This festival invites various countries to participate in and enliven it. Furthermore, the Borobudur Masterpiece Colossal Dance Performance recounts the history of Borobudur through art and culture to narrate the chronicles of the construction of this temple. Another interesting event and favorite activity presented to international visitors is enjoying the sunrise from the top of the temple. A different atmosphere presents visually for the visitors when the sun rises between the stupas. Events that support tourism are music concerts, cycling, and others. Moreover, attractions, events, and promotional facilities enliven this SKMB area. Other events may vary depending on who is the managing partner at the time. Figure 9 shows Borobudur the sense of place as attraction.

Promotional media are managed professionally, including the PT Taman Wisata Candi (TWC) website, social media, and YouTube channels. This promotional media increases the arrival of visitors to the Borobudur.
Table 2 Research Findings and Previous Studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comparative Study</th>
<th>Physical Attributes</th>
<th>Social Activities</th>
<th>Personal and Shared Meanings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Previous research</td>
<td>Built forms, landscape, furniture, permeability, intensity, scale, landmarks, and public realms (Relph, 1976; Canter (1977); Tuan (1978); Punter (1991); Montgomery (1998); Schulz (1980); Najafi &amp; Mohd Sharriff (2012); Hashemneshad, Heidari, &amp; Hoseini (2013))</td>
<td>Social interaction, pedestrian flows, and products</td>
<td>History, narration, event, and promotion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The research shows that the sense of place components in the Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) area include physical attributes (site, building, landmark), social activities (social interaction, pedestrian flows, and product), and personal and shared meanings (history, narration, and events & promotions) from the perspective of visitors. Future research needs to focus on different objects in the temple and SKMB. The explanation of the findings of the sense of place components is described in Table 2.

Table 2 shows that the research supports previous research in principle due to its commercial designation and the World Heritage Site Area, providing a fairly specific depth. The novelty is found in social activities with various local handicraft products and regional potentials that strengthen the local economy. Furthermore, they place identity, personal aspects, and shared meanings with history and narratives about the unique Borobudur temple background.

The management of Borobudur Temple, PT Taman Wisata Candi Borobudur, needs to create a better sense of place in the future. This includes the improvement of physical condition, personal aspects, and shared meaning. On the physical aspect, the management should display the identity of a place that visually connects with the temple complex and balances the majestic and grand character of the region. Furthermore, the material and shape comfort could be reviewed by replacing asbestos roofs and floor covering and designing the floor layout more compactly. For the social aspect, there is a need to improve understanding of the service-scape for business people/Medium and Small Enterprise/SMEs occupying this location (environmental arrangement, display, and customer service for satisfaction). Furthermore, online promotions could be intensified to develop businesses.

CONCLUSIONS

The research shows that the sense of place components in the Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) area include physical attributes (site, building, landmark), social activities (social interaction, pedestrian flows, and product), and personal and shared meanings (history, narration, and events & promotions) from the perspective of visitors. Future research needs to focus on different objects in the broader buffer area with an integrated method (mixed method) and from various segments’ perspectives. The theoretical implication of the research is to give a theoretical basis for similar research in the future. It contributes to similar research in architecture, urban planning, tourism, and social economy to complete perspective on preserving and raising the sense of place. Practically speaking, it will be useful in giving input to the stakeholders, such as the architects who will handle the cultural heritage buildings in the area, urban planning observers, and also the government as the area’s manager. Socially, these research and articles will be able to raise awareness over necessary factors to increase the image and atmosphere of an area which can multiply the number of tourists and increase the local community’s prosperity and regional economy.

For the managerial implication, the research suggests exploring and improving architectural forms, interior arrangements, displays, and materials from the Borobudur Food and Craft Market (SKMB) area. Furthermore, it recommends increasing the area layout and creative products and integrating local music. The sense of place should be processed visually, increasing the understanding of the service-scape by traders and more intense online imagery to strengthen visitors’ identity. This input could be accommodated in the next development step in this area.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This research was funded by a University Leading Applied Research grant by RISTEK DIKTI in 2021.

REFERENCES


