

Structural Relationship between Social Benefit, Dependency, Satisfaction, and Habit Formation on the Use of Social Media

Singgih Santoso¹; Budi Sutedjo Dharma Oetomo²

¹Department of Management, Faculty of Business, Duta Wacana Christian University

²Department of Information System, Faculty of Information Technology, Duta Wacana Christian University
Jln. Dr. Wahidin Sudirohusodo No.5-25, Yogyakarta 55224, Indonesia

¹singgih.santoso@gmail.com; ²budi@staff.ukdw.ac.id

Received: 7th February 2019/ **Revised:** 25th February 2019/ **Accepted:** 30th April 2019

How to Cite: Santoso, S., & Oetomo, B. S. D. (2019). Structural Relationship between Social Benefit, Dependency, Satisfaction, and Habit Formation on the Use of Social Media. *Binus Business Review*, 10(1), 51-57.
<https://doi.org/10.21512/bbr.v10i1.5407>

ABSTRACT

The main objective of the research was to investigate whether a consumers' habit formation was influenced by the satisfaction they got because of the social benefit and dependency on the use of social media. The research design used survey methods with questionnaires for 100 respondents. The researchers employed Structural Equation Models (SEM) with AMOS software to test the research model. From consumer's profiles, the results show that the most widely used types of social media are Line and Instagram. Most consumers use more than three hours every day to access social media to do tasks and chat. In testing the relationship between variables in the research model, the results show that dependency has a positive effect on satisfaction, but the social benefit does not. Moreover, satisfaction has a positive effect on habit formation. Those results show that consumer behavior through social media can be strengthened by increasing product satisfaction and the intense use of social media. Hence, the findings of this research may give insights to the marketer to use social media as a product quality promotion media.

Keywords: social benefit, dependency, satisfaction, habit formation, social media

INTRODUCTION

The progress of information technology has now penetrated all aspects of life. There are almost no activities that do not include information technology in terms of business, the purchase of goods and services, agriculture, biology, health and medicine, and communication between people.

Nowadays, one of the most significant phenomena in the world of information technology and telecommunications, especially the Internet, is the interaction between people through social media. It is estimated that the use of the Internet and social media was 44% of the population in Indonesia that was increasing rapidly from 22% in 2012 (Pertwi, 2018). The research of AC Nielsen in 2017 also showed that the biggest users of the Internet in Indonesia were the Y and Z generation (Nuzar, 2018).

Popular social media such as Facebook, Line, WhatsApp (WA), Instagram, and others have enabled someone to connect with other people in all places and at any time. For example, Facebook is used by approximately 1.600 million people (Ngai, Tao, & Moon, 2015; Bartosik-Purgat, Filipchuk, & Hinner, 2017). Social media can facilitate social interaction, make possible collaboration, and enable deliberation across stakeholders. It also has many technology tools (audio, photo, video, and text) (Bharucha, 2018).

The use of social media has been very popular today and provides many positive benefits. Moreover, Facebook's role is so large in society, and more or less has a role in encouraging marketing activities. However, there are also negative impacts of excessive use of social media such as the amount of time spent at the computer, often changing status on Facebook, and preferring to communicate online rather than meeting

physically. Dijkmans, Kerkhof, and Beukeboom (2015) studied the relationship between the use of social media and corporate reputation in many international airlines. They found that consumers' intimacy of social media use was positively related to their engagement in the airline's corporate reputation.

Although many companies recognize the need to be active in promoting their products and reputation through social media, they do not understand how to do it effectively. They propose to use social media as an ecosystem related elements involving both digital and traditional media. Davies, Musango, and Brent (2016) suggested focusing on the process of communication between consumers to form a habit formation in business. Social networking site, mainly Facebook, is used to communicate with others and find entertainment. In western and individualistic countries, social media are mainly the source of information (Hsu, Tien, Lin, & Chang, 2015; Ng, 2016). Briefly, nowadays social media is changing consumer behavior. Consumers are connected to products and services better and have more knowledge about companies and their services (Itani, Agnihotri, & Dingus, 2017).

In the business, social media are widely used by the companies to establish intense relationships with their consumers or try to introduce their brands. CMO Survey showed that the company's budget for promotional activities through social media reached 15% to 21% of the total marketing budget. However, the success and positive impact leading to increased sales turnover were still difficult to measure (Pemberton, 2018). Moreover, Hudson, Huang, Roth, and Madden (2016) stated that social media had emerged as a prominent digital communication which consumers shared information and interacted with brands, purchased it, and evaluated after purchasing.

Therefore, marketers are adjusting their marketing and promotion strategies to reach consumers. They are placing more emphasis on competing for consumers' social media attention to drive consumers' awareness and engagement (Neff, 2014). However, Traphagen (2015) suggested that social media engagements were ineffective in stimulating brand loyalty and sales and predicting consumer behavior.

Another characteristic of social media is the loss of corporate control over circulating conversations and information. Because it is open and public, companies in certain communities must be aware of their loss of control over all conversations. If it is not handled correctly, the negative impact of social media is the reduced reputation of the company or a brand, the failure of promotion, and the loss of potential consumers or actual consumers. In many activities, use of the Internet has an overall positive effect on psychological well-being by obtaining emotional support when feeling lonely, making friends, and having a broader understanding of the real world (Lee & Cheung, 2014).

Relations between people formed through social media will increase social benefits. Many

researchers generally state that the social benefits are obtained by someone when she/he interacts socially via social media such as supporting something, finding information related to something, or giving certain advice (Thadani & Cheung, 2011). Others add that social activity like this can increase self-confidence in some people and can improve their life satisfaction (Valkenburg & Peter, 2009). In current business practices, these benefits can be expanded into information, advice, or encouragement to engage in goods or service consumption.

In the long term, social relations are built through social media accompanied by high usage and dependency on the internet. Thus, the assessment of a brand and the desire to buy and consume a product or brand will depend a lot on the opinions and suggestions given by consumers in social media.

This will lead to satisfaction or dissatisfaction in a person after she/he consumes a brand with guidance and encouragement from members of the social media. Satisfaction can be interpreted as positive feelings and rejoicing because of something that someone has done or experienced. If the satisfaction continues to be formed, because he consumes the goods or service, or because she/he has obeyed the members of the social media, in a certain period, habits will be formed (Thadani & Cheung, 2011).

Amati, Meggiolaro, Rivellini, and Zaccarin (2018) analyzed the impact of social relation to satisfaction. They found that friendship or social relation measured by physical meeting frequencies between friends had a positive association to satisfaction. One of social relation impact is social benefit, which could influence satisfaction. Liu and Tsai (2012) explained that if someone was a member of an active group in social media, in the future, she/he might have many visitors, so she/he can benefit financially, culturally, or socially from having that access.

The research shows that people who are satisfied with the activities on social media and gets many friends will tend to have a good self-image and enjoy their social life (Valkenburg & Peter, 2009). However, not all intensive social relations will lead to satisfaction. For example, regular users of the MySpace felt socially eliminated in their community compared to MySpace users who did not intensively use the application (Bharucha, 2018). Thus, the first hypothesis is as follows:

H1 : Social benefits affect satisfaction positively and significantly.

On the other hand, the social relations that are established through social media will encourage someone to connect more and access many things without needing to meet face to face. This situation leads to dependency on electronic social media. Although this dependency can lead to negative things, society Tang-Mui and Teng (2017) stated that social media could encourage familiarity, which if it

started from the family, it could spread to everyone. Dependency on social media is the situation, which an individual cannot stop his/her desire to access the contents of social media many times a day. This is related to the helplessness to regulate life and daily activities (Bharucha, 2018).

Andreassen (2015) stated that social media addiction was different from excessive time spent on social media. An addicted individual was compulsive and uncontrolled with their behavior. For example, 2% of US adults were addicts. However, the low prevalence rate of 1,6% was found in a Nigerian which could be explained by the low Internet accessibility.

Thadani and Cheung (2011) stated that social media dependency moderated the relation between interpersonal interconnectivity with satisfaction. People who had addictive behaviors were often accompanied by several psychological processes affecting their satisfaction. With 200 Facebook users in Vietnam market, Tran and Huynh (2015) assumed that higher social interaction decreased users' satisfaction, and found that social media dependency affected satisfaction significantly. So, the second hypothesis is:

H2 : Dependency on social media affects satisfaction positively and significantly.

In the process of habit formation, a person's satisfaction generally plays a significant role. Many researchers show that high satisfaction from someone when accessing or relating to a particular community will increase their dependence on social media and begin to shape their habits in behavior. High satisfaction in making a purchase will encourage someone to become a loyal consumer and reduce the negative impact of social media.

Moreover, Ramanathan, Subramanian, and Parrott (2017) mentioned there was a significant and positive relationship between consumer experience information through social media and consumers satisfaction. They also suggested that satisfaction construct could be formed by social media review, brand satisfaction, and service operation. This result showed that the role of social media was more important to form consumer satisfaction. Based on Itani *et al.* (2017), satisfaction is influenced by social media with information communication as a mediating variable. However, Keiningham, Gupta, Aksoy, and Buoye (2014) stated that the relationship between consumers satisfaction and spending behavior was very weak. They suggested that satisfied consumers did not necessarily have a purchase intention.

Habit formation can be defined as an automatic response to repeat the response when it is given stable support. Forming habits is related to support long-term behavior change through automated response. It increases the likelihood in people who will persist over the longer term, even when motivation fades, and the will power is low (Renfree, Harrison, Marshall, Stawarz, & Cox, 2016).

Habits are also defined as automatic behavior

triggered by situational cues without self-instruction or conscious thinking. It can have positive and negative effects, and enable multitasking and accomplishing complex tasks (Van Deursen, Bolle, Hegner, & Kommers, 2015). In practice, a person's habit of acting is not only in a situation but also applies to a buying situation. Thus, it is necessary to study these customized habits with someone's behavior especially in conducting online transactions.

Many social media enable users to send information with privacy. It became a habit for the young generation to use those media when they share about their activities or thoughts. The more people use social media to interact frequently, the more they form a habit to link together and act collectively (Wu, Li, & Chang, 2016). Then, the last hypothesis is:

H3 : Satisfaction has a positive and significant influence on habit formation.

Social media is currently one of the most popular topics in the world of information technology and telecommunications. There are many applications for these activities. Moreover, the online community is the main medium for individuals to express themselves and socialize. However, the research on individual activities in becoming a consumer through their activities on social media is still not a lot (Tran & Huynh, 2015).

From the discussion, the objective of the research is to test whether social benefit and dependency are related to satisfaction. Then, the researchers will also analyze whether satisfaction is related to habit formation. The research is based on the previous researchers (Chan, 2014; Tran & Huynh, 2015) . The model is in Figure 1.



Figure 1 Research Model

METHODS

The research design is a survey method using a questionnaire. The researchers send the questionnaire to 150 students. The questionnaires are distributed to students in Duta Wacana Christian University, Yogyakarta Special Region Province. As the respondent, the students will be given the opportunity to fill out a questionnaire if they meet the criteria applied by the researchers like they are accustomed to using social media in their daily activities. Data collection was conducted from May to September

2018. Students are chosen because they are the young and millennial generation. Students spend their free time to interact and do other activities through social media. Thus, they are the suitable respondents in this research. The sampling technique used is purposive sampling. Respondents will be given a questionnaire, which consists of two parts. The first part is the information about their profile, such as gender, age, expenditure per month, residence, and their behavior in communicating through social media. Meanwhile, the second part is a questionnaire which contains questions to test the research model mentioned.

For social benefits, the indicators are that respondents feel comfortable, confident, safe, and well treated by friends. Then, indicators for dependency are feeling very dependent, wanting to connect with other people, and being unable to control time. Next, the indicators for satisfaction are feeling happy, being satisfied with the social media facility and overall satisfaction. Last, for habit formation, the indicators are daily activities that are always related to gadgets and buying a product through gadgets.

After the questionnaire has been collected and passed validity and reliability tests, the preliminary processing is carried out. It is to ascertain how much data is missing and how many entries are incorrect.

After that, data will be processed for research models by Structural Equation Models (SEM) using AMOS software. The collected data will be analyzed using a cross tab for profile data and structural model analysis to test the research model. SEM test had several important stages. First, it is defining the existing construct. Secondly, it is developing a measurement model. Third, the process continues by testing the measurement model. Last, the structural model specification and the validity of the structural model are carried out.

Several tests of goodness of fit criteria have been developed to interpret a structural equation model. It is to determine the degree of compatibility of a model with the empirical data obtained. Commonly used goodness of fit criteria is based on covariance matrix comparisons of data observed with the estimated covariance matrix with several measures. It includes Chi-Square, Goodness of Fit Index (GFI), Adjusted Goodness of Fit Index (AGFI), Root Mean Square Error of Approximation (RMSEA), Non-Normed Fit Index or Tucker-Lewis Index (TLI), Normed Fit Index (NFI), and Comparative Fit Index (CFI).

For the Chi-Square criteria (χ^2), a low number of χ^2 and a probability level above 0,05 indicate no difference between the observed data and the estimated data. However, the magnitude of χ^2 is sensitive to the number of samples. If the sample exceeds 200, χ^2 tends to increase. In addition, χ^2 is also sensitive to deviations in the assumption of the normality of data. To minimize the impact of the number of samples, the criteria for χ^2 to the Degree of Freedom (DF) are developed. The χ^2 / DF for good models is between 2:1 to 3:1. Some criteria for the goodness of fit in SEM can be seen in Table 1.

Table 1 Goodness of Fit Criteria

The goodness of fit criteria	Scale
χ^2 / DF	2 – 3
RMSEA	< 0,07
GFI	> 0,90
AGFI	> 0,90
TLI	> 0,95
CFI	> 0,95
NFI	> 0,90

(Sources: Hair, Black, Babin, & Anderson, 2014; Rose, Markman, & Sawilowsky, 2017)

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Table 2 Profile of Respondents

No	Description	Classification	%
1	Gender	Male	52,0
		Female	48,0
2	Ethnic	Javanese	22,0
		Batak	13,3
		Chinese	10,0
		Balinese	2,0
		Dayak	14,7
		Toraja	6,7
		Ambon	4,0
3	Expenditure per Month	<Rp1.000.000,00/ month	26,0
		>Rp1.000.000,00/ month – <Rp1.500.000,00/ month	37,3
		>Rp1.500.000,00 / month – <Rp2.000.000,00/ month	22,0
		>Rp2.000.000,00/ month	14,7
4	Social Media Usage Frequency	Below one hour	2,0
		1 – 2 hours per day	12,7
		2 – 3 hours per day	12,7
		>3 hours per day	72,6
5	Social Media	Facebook	13,5
		Twitter	13,5
		WhatsApp	3,5
		Line	24,6
		Instagram	19,3
		Others	25,6
6	Purpose of Social Media Usage	Chatting	35,5
		Task Management	29,4
		Problem Solving	18,0
		Business Activities	15,3
		Others	1,8

In Table 2, the male respondents dominate the survey with 52,0%. Most of them have the ethnicity of Sundanese, Papua, Bugis, Madura, and Timor. Then, they have average expenditure of Rp1000.000,00 – Rp1.500.000,00 in a month (37,3%). They spend more than three hours in social media (72,6%). The most used social media is Youtube, Blog, Wechat, Telegram, or other interactive social media (25,6%). They like to use social media for chatting (35,5%).

Table 2 suggests that Internet and social media penetration has been evenly distributed in terms of gender, ethnic, usage frequency, and expenditure. This shows that consumers' habit formation in using social media for consumption purposes is due to the benefits of social media and how often they use the internet to interact, not by who they are. Internet and social media usage for young people continues to increase with various social media used. In addition, the main purpose of conversation through social media is more on fostering social relations and problem-solving. This encourages the habit formation of not meeting physically and dependence on electronic social media. This will encourages the purchase of goods and services done through the use of social media rather than buying offline.

Table 3 Goodness of Fit Test Result

Goodness of fit	Result
χ^2 / DF	1,960
RMSEA	0,080
TLI	0,774
CFI	0,830
NFI	0,719

The model testing and estimation of relationships between variables using AMOS software are shown in Table 3. The results of the conformity test show that the Chi-Square Minimum / Degree of Freedom (CMIN / DF) number is below 2, and the error rate (RMSEA) is 0,08. Meanwhile, the numbers of TLI, CFI, and NFI are still below 0,9, but those are already above 0,75. It indicates moderate suitability. Thus, it can be said that the research model is appropriate (fit) with the theoretical model. Then, the process is continued by looking at the relationships between variables.

Table 4 Regression Coefficient Test Result

Variable Relationship	Significant Number
Social Benefit -> Satisfaction	0,165
Dependence -> Satisfaction	0,001
Satisfaction -> Habit Formation	0,000

From the results in Table 4, it can be seen that the social benefit has a significance number of 0,165 or above 0,05. It shows that social benefit does not affect satisfaction. Thus, H1 is rejected. The social benefit in social media activities does not affect respondents' satisfaction. This result differs from other researchers in Vietnam which proposed that social benefits significantly affected satisfaction (Tran & Huynh, 2015). This difference between the two countries (Indonesia and Vietnam) can be further explored in the future because of their differences in culture and lifestyle. Since social benefit does not affect satisfaction for social media users, corporate promotion activities through community marketing can directly introduce product excellence, distribution power, or other company superior aspects. Hu, Kettinger, and Poston (2015) studied the social media activities in Europe with social values or benefit as a formative aggregate construct consisting of utilitarian value benefit, hedonic value benefit, and sacrifices dimensions. Their results also showed that social benefit influenced consumer satisfaction positively and significantly. In Indonesia, as seen in respondents profile, many respondents use internet and social media are young with an average income per month, and most use the internet more than 3 hours per day to chat each others and do daily task. They depend more on the internet's speed and stable connections than their activities with social media.

Moreover, the dependency has a positive and significant effect on satisfaction. It is indicated by the magnitude of the significant number of 0,001 which is far below 0,05. Thus, H2 is accepted. Moreover, satisfaction has a positive and significant effect on the habit formation with a significance number of 0,000. So, H3 is accepted. This result is in line with research in Asian countries and Europe (Hu *et al.*, 2015; Tran & Huynh, 2015). The important implication is that companies should intensify promotion through social media and online marketing because consumer dependence will be increasingly higher in the future.

The research model that describes the relationship between the four variables is in accordance with the theoretical model. Moreover, the hypotheses are partially acceptable. People who are in their daily activities depending on smartphone by accessing it at least three hours per day tend to be satisfied with its capabilities in satisfying their needs (basic needs, social needs, and ego needs). Satisfaction that continues to accumulate with more frequent use of a smartphone will shape the habits of the person in behaving. These habits can affect their consumption behavior patterns on goods and services. Those who are satisfied and accustomed to using digital devices in communication will tend to access sites, blog, Instagram, Line, and others to connect with sellers and brand endorsers who have promoted a product. This has implications for the need for companies to use promotional media and the formation of consumer awareness through social media. However, the social benefits that a person receives when using social media do not affect

their satisfaction. This result shows that the long-term and routine use of social media is considered normal for most respondents, so the factors that shape social benefits, such as convenience, security, or self-confidence, do not determine the satisfaction in using social media.

Because the millennial segment has been massive and intensive using social media, market penetration through social media needs to be done intensively. The promotion intensity can be increased by displaying product advertisements or information on social media regularly, changing the content and context of advertising consistently, and positioning the brand as a millennial segment that always follows changes in consumer behavior and tastes. Since the habit formation is from the level of satisfaction with the use of social media, the companies can promote their products through social media. The promotional content needs to be well designed and with relevant contexts to reach millennial market segments. For theory contribution, this research can enrich the understanding of the habit formation using social media theory, which is accompanied by gender as a moderating variable.

CONCLUSIONS

From the analysis of the respondents' profiles, the results show that the most widely used social media are Line and Instagram. Moreover, the researchers find that most of the respondents use more than three hours each day to access social media. From the structural model testing, the results show that the research model has met the goodness of fit requirements. In the estimation, it appears that the social benefit does not affect satisfaction. However, dependency has a positive and significant effect on satisfaction. Meanwhile, satisfaction has a positive and significant effect on habit formation. If research model testing is divided into male and female social media users, t-test statistics result still show the same pattern. Male users consider that social benefit is not related to their satisfaction in using social media (prob. 0,066). However, their dependence affects satisfaction (prob. 0,027), and satisfaction influences habit formation (prob. 0,00). The result is similar to female users. This finding is very interesting for future research, especially on the influence of gender in social media activities that have an impact on buying and consumption patterns.

For further research, the research variable can be added to illustrate the effect of using social media on the intention to buy, not only to examine the level of dependence. Variables have been directed at the use of social media for business and marketing activities. It is also recommended that there is a research on the influence of moderating variables that may influence the research model such as gender, ethnic, parent work origin (the respondents' parents/previous generation are entrepreneurs or who have already been in business or not). The results of the moderating variables are

important for testing hypotheses about the influence of gender, ethnic, and background in the use of social media in dealing with their groups.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This research was supported by a grant from Lembaga Penelitian dan Pengabdian Masyarakat (LPPM - Institute Research and Community Service) in Duta Wacana Christian University in 2018.

REFERENCES

- Amati, V., Meggiolaro, S., Rivellini, G., & Zaccarin, S. (2018). Social relations and life satisfaction: The role of friends. *Genus*, 74(7), 1-18.
- Andreassen, C. S. (2015). Online social network site addiction: A comprehensive review. *Current Addiction Reports*, 2(2), 175-184.
- Bartosik-Purgat, M., Filipchuk, O., & Hinner, M. B. (2017). Communication and consumer activities of social networking sites users: Cases from Germany, Poland and Russia. *Managing Global Transitions*, 15(4), 341-363.
- Bharucha, J. (2018). Social media and young consumers behavior. *International Journal of Supply Chain Management*, 7(6), 72-81.
- Chan, T. H. (2014). Facebook and its effects on users' empathic social skills and life satisfaction: A double-edged sword effect. *Cyberpsychology, Behavior, and Social Networking*, 17(5), 276-280.
- Davies, M., Musango, J. K., & Brent, A. C. (2016). A systems approach to understanding the effect of Facebook use on the quality of interpersonal communication. *Technology in Society*, 44(February), 55-65.
- Dijkmans, C., Kerkhof, P., & Beukeboom, C. J. (2015). A stage to engage: Social media use and corporate reputation. *Tourism management*, 47(April), 58-67.
- Hair, J. F., Black, W. C., Babin, B. J., & Anderson, R. E. (2014). *Multivariate data analysis* (7th ed.). Edinburgh Gate: Pearson Education Limited.
- Hsu, M. H., Tien, S. W., Lin, H. C., & Chang, C. M. (2015). Understanding the roles of cultural differences and socio-economic status in social media continuance intention. *Information Technology & People*, 28(1), 224-241.
- Hu, T., Kettinger, W. J., & Poston, R. S. (2015). The effect of online social value on satisfaction and continued use of social media. *European Journal of Information Systems*, 24(4), 391-410.
- Hudson, S., Huang, L., Roth, M. S., & Madden, T. J. (2016). The influence of social media interactions on consumer-brand relationships: A three-country study of brand perceptions and marketing behaviors. *International Journal of Research in Marketing*, 33(1), 27-41.
- Itani, O. S., Agnihotri, R., & Dingus, R. (2017). Social media use in B2B sales and its impact on competitive intelligence collection and adaptive selling: Examining the role of learning orientation

- as an enabler. *Industrial Marketing Management*, 66(October), 64-79.
- Keiningham, T., Gupta, S., Aksoy, L., & Buoye, A. (2014). The high price of customer satisfaction. *MIT Sloan Management Review*, 55(3), 37-46.
- Lee, Z. W. Y., & Cheung, C. M. K. (2014). Problematic use of social networking sites: The role of self-esteem. *International Journal of Business and Information*, 9(2), 143-159.
- Liu, Y., & Tsai, Y. R. (2012). The impact of social networking services (SNS) on college students' social relationship and private life. *International Journal of Arts and Commerce*, 1(4), 1-10.
- Neff, J. (2014). *Digital is selling more soap than it gets credit for: Nielsen study- Google, Facebook underestimated by marketing-Mix models in survey backed by seven top CPG players*. Retrieved from <https://adage.com/article/digital/study-digital-return-investment-undervalued/291772/>
- Ng, M. (2016). Factors influencing the consumer adoption of Facebook: A two-country study of youth markets. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 54(January), 491-500.
- Ngai, E. W., Tao, S. S., & Moon, K. K. (2015). Social media research: Theories, constructs, and conceptual frameworks. *International Journal of Information Management*, 35(1), 33-44.
- Nuzar, I. (2018). *Penetrasi Internet Indonesia didominasi Gen Z*. Retrieved from <http://teknopreneur.com/2018/02/19/penetrasi-internet-indonesia-didominasi-gen-z/>
- Pemberon, C. (2018). *8 top findings in Gartner CMO spend survey 2018-19*. Retrieved from <https://www.gartner.com/en/marketing/insights/articles/8-top-findings-in-gartner-cmo-spend-survey-2018-19>
- Pertiwi, W. K. (2018). *Riset ungkap pola pemakaian medsos orang Indonesia*. Retrieved from <https://tekno.kompas.com/read/2018/03/01/10340027/riset-ungkap-pola-pemakaian-medsos-orang-indonesia>
- Ramanathan, U., Subramanian, N., & Parrott, G. (2017). Role of social media in retail network operations and marketing to enhance customer satisfaction. *International Journal of Operations & Production Management*, 37(1), 105-123.
- Renfree, I., Harrison, D., Marshall, P., Stawarz, K., & Cox, A. (2016). Don't kick the habit: The role of dependency in habit formation apps. In *Proceedings of the 2016 CHI Conference Extended Abstracts on Human Factors in Computing Systems* (pp. 2932-2939).
- Rose, S. A., Markman, B., & Sawilowsky, S. (2017). Limitations in the systematic analysis of structural equation model fit indices. *Journal of Modern Applied Statistical Methods*, 16(1), 69-85.
- Tang-Mui, J., & Teng, C. E. (2017). Impacts of social media (Facebook) on human communication and relationships: A view on behavioral change and social unity. *International Journal of Knowledge Content Development & Technology*, 7(4), 27-50.
- Thadani, D. R., & Cheung, C. M. (2011). Online social network dependency: Theoretical development and testing of competing models. In *2011 44th Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences* (pp. 1-9).
- Tran, V. D., & Huynh, N. D. T. (2015). Exploring the relationships among social benefits, online social network dependency, satisfaction, and youth's habit formation. *International Journal of Cyber Society and Education*, 8(2), 99-116.
- Traphagen, M. (2015). *Why engagement does matter as a social media metric*. Retrieved from <http://marketingland.com/engagementmatter-social-media-metric-114497>
- Van Deursen, A. J., Bolle, C. L., Hegner, S. M., & Kommers, P. A. (2015). Modeling habitual and addictive smartphone behavior: The role of smartphone usage types, emotional intelligence, social stress, self-regulation, age, and gender. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 45(April), 411-420.
- Valkenburg, P. M., & Peter, J. (2009). Social consequences of the Internet for adolescents: A decade of research. *Current directions in psychological science*, 18(1), 1-5.
- Wu, Y. L., Li, E. Y., & Chang, W. L. (2016). Nurturing user creative performance in social media networks: An integration of habit of use with social capital and information exchange theories. *Internet Research*, 26(4), 869-900.